

Contents

Acknowledgements	V
List of abbreviations	XIV

Introduction

I. Research topic	1
II. Research objectives and scope	5
III. Research methodology and proceedings	9

Chapter 1

The international criminal courts and tribunals and their relationship to national accountability mechanisms

I. The core mandates and current practice of the ICTY and ICTR	12
A. Contextual background	12
1. The former Yugoslavia	12
2. Rwanda	17
3. Comparative analysis	21
B. Overall goals of the ICTY and ICTR	22
1. Primary goals	22
2. Secondary goals	24
C. Jurisdictional ambit of the ICTY and ICTR and relationship to national accountability mechanisms	25
1. Temporal and territorial jurisdiction	25
2. Personal and subject-matter jurisdiction	26
3. Primary and concurrent jurisdiction of the ICTY and ICTR vis-à-vis national courts	27
II. The core mandate and current practice of the ICC	29
A. Contextual background	29
B. Overall goals	30
1. Primary goals	30
2. Secondary goals	31

C.	Jurisdictional ambit and relationship to national accountability mechanisms	32
1.	Temporal and territorial jurisdiction	33
2.	Personal and subject-matter jurisdiction	34
3.	Subsidiary and complementary jurisdiction vis-à-vis national systems	36
III.	Concluding remarks	37

Chapter 2

The referral practice to national courts as a crucial component of the ICTY and ICTR Completion Strategy and legal problems resulting from its implementation

I.	Origins of the Completion Strategy	40
II.	Goals of the Completion Strategy	43
A.	Reduction of the ICTY and ICTR caseload	44
1.	Focus on high-level perpetrators and level of responsibility of accused	45
2.	Referral of intermediate and lower-level accused to national jurisdictions	46
B.	Nationalization of the accountability process	47
III.	The Completion Strategy's referral practice: features and legal problems	49
A.	Referral of cases under rule 11 <i>bis</i> RPE of the ICTY and ICTR	50
1.	Formal features	51
2.	Pre-transfer criteria	53
a)	Determination of the state of referral	53
b)	Determination of adequate national framework	57
aa)	ICTY jurisprudence: Bosnia and Herzegovina	59
(1)	Category of crimes	61
(2)	Mode of commission of crimes	62
(3)	Penalty structure	65
(4)	Conclusion of pre-transfer criteria to Bosnia and Herzegovina	67
bb)	ICTR jurisprudence	69
(1)	Rwanda	69
(2)	Norway	76
(3)	France	77
c)	Fair-trial guarantees and non-imposition of the death penalty	79
aa)	ICTY jurisprudence: Bosnia and Herzegovina	81
bb)	ICTR jurisprudence: Rwanda	83
d)	Gravity of crimes and level of responsibility of the accused	92

aa) ICTY jurisprudence	92
bb) ICTR jurisprudence	97
3. Post-referral aspects	99
B. Referral of investigative materials by the ICTY and ICTR	101
1. Lack of ICTY/ICTR monitoring function following the national court's final verdict	101
2. Divergences in the investigation and prosecution of crimes falling within the jurisdiction of the ICTY/ICTR and national prosecution offices	102
IV. The ICTY and ICTR experiences compared	103
V. Concluding remarks	106

Chapter 3

Possible root causes of legal problems resulting from the implementation of the ICTY/ICTR referral practice to national courts

I. Normative factors: discrepancies in applicable legal norms	109
A. Different laws to prosecute the same crimes	110
1. Bosnia and Herzegovina	111
a) Substantive criminal laws	112
b) Criminal procedure laws	123
2. Rwanda	124
a) Substantive criminal laws	125
b) Fair-trial guarantees and applicable penalties	126
3. Comparative analysis	128
B. System clashes: the inquisitorial versus the adversarial approach	129
1. Bosnia and Herzegovina	131
2. Rwanda	134
3. Comparative analysis	138
4. France	138
5. Comparative analysis: BiH, Rwanda and France	141
C. Conclusion	141
II. Contextual factors: national context as a crucial criterion for referral	142
A. The presence of a functioning criminal justice system	142
1. Bosnia and Herzegovina	143
2. Rwanda	144
3. Comparative analysis	146
B. The scale of crimes	146
1. Bosnia and Herzegovina	147
2. Rwanda	149
3. Comparative analysis	151

C.	Political sensitivity of cases and impact on judicial independence and impartiality	152
1.	Bosnia and Herzegovina	153
2.	Rwanda	155
3.	Comparative analysis	158
D.	Financial and logistical assistance from the international community	159
1.	Bosnia and Herzegovina	159
2.	Rwanda	161
3.	Comparative analysis	163
III.	Concluding remarks	164

Chapter 4

The ICTY/ICTR referral practice: impact and possible solutions

I.	Impact of the ICTY/ICTR referral practice	166
A.	The referral practice's contribution to the ICTY's and ICTR's overall objectives	166
B.	The referral practice's contribution to the Completion Strategy's objectives	166
1.	Judicial economy	167
2.	Nationalization of accountability and the impact of referral on national reconciliation	169
II.	Possible solutions to some legal problems identified	177
A.	Systematic solutions	177
1.	Explicit clarification regarding the substantive law analysis	177
2.	Explicit consideration of legal tradition employed at national level	179
3.	Strengthening of the post-referral monitoring mechanism	179
4.	Early establishment of a Transition Team	181
a)	ICTY	181
b)	ICTR	182
5.	Conclusion	182
B.	Specific solutions based on context	183
III.	Concluding remarks	185

Chapter 5

ICTY/ICTR referral practice: What relevance for the ICC?

I.	Relevance despite different jurisdictional frameworks	187
II.	Referral regulations in the Rome Statute of the ICC	188
A.	Case referrals following a successful challenge to the ICC's admissibility under article 19 of the Rome Statute	188

B. Referral of evidence obtained during an ICC investigation or trial	194
C. Case referrals as part of an ICC completion or exit strategy	197
D. Conclusion	199
III. Referral as an illustration of complementarity in practice: difficulties and prospects	199
A. Case studies	201
1. Uganda	201
2. Democratic Republic of Congo	202
3. Kenya	204
IV. Some possible lessons learned from the ICTY and ICTR referral practice for the ICC	206
A. Clarification of applicable substantive laws	206
B. Strong post-referral monitoring mechanism	207
C. Early Establishment of a Transition Team	208
Conclusion and outlook	210
Appendix	214
Bibliography	219