## Contents

Acknowledgements				XVII
Pa	rt I	Foun	dations	
1	Intr	roduction		3
	1.1	A Brie	ef History of Metaphysics	3
	1.2	Why I	Do Metaphysics?	5
		1.2.1	Fatalism and alternative possibilities	6
		1.2.2	Causation: rights, responsibilities, and knowledge	6
		1.2.3	The foundations of science: laws, space, and time	7
		1.2.4	Mind and body	7
		1.2.5	Personal identity and persistence	8
	1.3	How	to Use the Book	9
2	Tru	13		
	2.1	Intro	duction	13
		2.1.1	Propositions	14
		2.1.2	Truthmakers	17
	2.2	Five A	Arguments for Classical Truthmaker Theory	19
	2.3	The C	Challenge of Deflationism	25
	2.4	Truth	maker Maximalism	30
		2.4.1	Fundamentality and logically complex propositions	30
		2.4.2	The problem of negative existentials	31
	2.5	Alteri	natives to Truthmaker Maximalism	36
		2.5.1	Atomic Truthmaker Theory	37
		2.5.2	Spectral Truthmaker Theory	40
		2.5.3	Truth Supervenes on Being	42
	2.6	Concl	lusion and Preview	44
	Not	es		45
3	Gro	unding	g, Ontological Dependence, and Fundamentality	47
	3.1		ounding Real?	49

viii Contents

		3.1.1	Connections with natural language	49
		3.1.2	Plausible examples of grounding	49
		3.1.3	Philosophical debates that turn on grounding claims	50
		3.1.4	Fruitfulness of grounding	51
		3.1.5	Grounding is different from conceptual priority, reduction, and	
			supervenience	52
	3.2	Relation	on between Grounding and Truthmaking	55
		3.2.1	Interdefinability?	55
		3.2.2	Can grounding theory replace truthmaker theory?	56
	3.3	Relation	on between Grounding and Ontological Dependence	58
		3.3.1	Two kinds of essence	58
		3.3.2	1 ,	58
		3.3.3	•	59
		3.3.4	Grounding and essence	61
	3.4		eptual vs. Extra-Conceptual Grounding	62
		3.4.1	The ontological import of grounding	64
		3.4.2	Support for the One Truthmaker per Fundamental Property Principle	65
	3.5		natives to Grounding?	65
		3.5.1	Quine's method of paraphrase	66
		3.5.2	Fine's really operator	67
		3.5.3	Primitive fundamentality, naturalness, and primitive structure	68
	3.6		Grounding Relations be Grounded?	69
	3.7		ections between Grounding and Entailment	71
	3.8		s Grounding Different from Causal Explanation?	72
	3.9		usion: Grounding and Ontological Economy	72
	Note	es		73
Pa	rt II	Disp	ositions	
	_			
4	Con	dition	als	77
4	Con 4.1		als terfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics	77 78
4		Count		
4	4.1	Count Hypot	terfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics	78
4	4.1 4.2	Count Hypot Anti-I	terfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics theticalism	78 84
4	4.1 4.2 4.3	Count Hypot Anti-I Strong	terfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics Theticalism Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature	78 84 86
	4.1 4.2 4.3 4.4 Note	Count Hypot Anti-I Strong	terfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics Theticalism Typotheticalism and Laws of Nature Typotheticalism: Counterfactual Accounts of Powers and Dispositions	78 84 86 90 92
5	4.1 4.2 4.3 4.4 Note	Count Hypot Anti-I Strong es	terfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics cheticalism Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature g Hypotheticalism: Counterfactual Accounts of Powers and Dispositions	78 84 86 90 92
	4.1 4.2 4.3 4.4 Note Law 5.1	Count Hypot Anti-I Strong es Strong	terfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics cheticalism Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature Hypotheticalism: Counterfactual Accounts of Powers and Dispositions Hypotheticalism: Counterfactual Accounts of Powers and Dispositions Hure Hypotheticalism: The Dretske-Armstrong-Tooley (DAT) Theory of Laws	78 84 86 90 92 94
	4.1 4.2 4.3 4.4 Note	Count Hypot Anti-I Stronges s of Na Strong Neo-I	terfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics cheticalism Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature Hypotheticalism: Counterfactual Accounts of Powers and Dispositions Hure Hypotheticalism: The Dretske-Armstrong-Tooley (DAT) Theory of Laws Humeism: Reduction of Conditionals, Laws, and Powers	78 84 86 90 92 94 94 99
	4.1 4.2 4.3 4.4 Note Law 5.1	Count Hypot Anti-I Strong es s of Na Strong Neo-I 5.2.1	terfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics cheticalism Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature g Hypotheticalism: Counterfactual Accounts of Powers and Dispositions atture g Nomism: The Dretske-Armstrong-Tooley (DAT) Theory of Laws Humeism: Reduction of Conditionals, Laws, and Powers Argument from scientific realism	78 84 86 90 92 94 94 99
	4.1 4.2 4.3 4.4 Note Law 5.1	Count Hypot Anti-I Strong ss s of Na Strong Neo-I 5.2.1 5.2.2	terfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics theticalism Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature Hypotheticalism: Counterfactual Accounts of Powers and Dispositions Huture Hypotheticalism: The Dretske-Armstrong-Tooley (DAT) Theory of Laws Humeism: Reduction of Conditionals, Laws, and Powers Argument from scientific realism The extrinsicality objection and small worlds	78 84 86 90 92 94 94 99 100
	4.1 4.2 4.3 4.4 Note Law 5.1	Count Hypot Anti-I Strong es s of Na Strong Neo-I 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3	terfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics cheticalism Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature g Hypotheticalism: Counterfactual Accounts of Powers and Dispositions atture g Nomism: The Dretske-Armstrong-Tooley (DAT) Theory of Laws Humeism: Reduction of Conditionals, Laws, and Powers Argument from scientific realism	78 84 86 90 92 94 94 99
5	4.1 4.2 4.3 4.4 Note Law 5.1 5.2	Count Hypot Anti-I Strong es s of Na Strong Neo-I 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3	terfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics theticalism Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature By Hypotheticalism: Counterfactual Accounts of Powers and Dispositions atture By Nomism: The Dretske-Armstrong-Tooley (DAT) Theory of Laws Humeism: Reduction of Conditionals, Laws, and Powers Argument from scientific realism The extrinsicality objection and small worlds Objection based on induction	78 84 86 90 92 94 94 99 100 102 103
	4.1 4.2 4.3 4.4 Note 5.1 5.2	Count Hypot Anti-I Strong s of Na Strong Neo-I 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3	terfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics cheticalism Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature g Hypotheticalism: Counterfactual Accounts of Powers and Dispositions atture g Nomism: The Dretske-Armstrong-Tooley (DAT) Theory of Laws Humeism: Reduction of Conditionals, Laws, and Powers Argument from scientific realism The extrinsicality objection and small worlds Objection based on induction	78 84 86 90 92 94 94 99 100 102 103 105
5	4.1 4.2 4.3 4.4 Note Law 5.1 5.2	Count Hypot Anti-I Strong ss s of Na Strong Neo-H 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3 ss	terfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics theticalism Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature g Hypotheticalism: Counterfactual Accounts of Powers and Dispositions  atture g Nomism: The Dretske-Armstrong-Tooley (DAT) Theory of Laws Humeism: Reduction of Conditionals, Laws, and Powers Argument from scientific realism The extrinsicality objection and small worlds Objection based on induction  d Properties stages of Strong Powerism	78 84 86 90 92 94 94 99 100 102 103 105
5	4.1 4.2 4.3 4.4 Note 5.1 5.2	Count Hypot Anti-I Strong ss s of Na Strong Neo-H 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3 es	terfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics theticalism Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature Hypotheticalism: Counterfactual Accounts of Powers and Dispositions Hure Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature Hypotheticalism: Counterfactual Accounts of Powers and Dispositions Hure Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature Hypotheticalism Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature Hypotheticalism Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature Hypotheticalism	78 84 86 90 92 94 94 99 100 102 103 105
5	4.1 4.2 4.3 4.4 Note 5.1 5.2	Counting Hypote Anti-I Stronges Strong Neo-H 5.2.1 5.2.2 5.2.3 es	terfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics theticalism Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature g Hypotheticalism: Counterfactual Accounts of Powers and Dispositions  atture g Nomism: The Dretske-Armstrong-Tooley (DAT) Theory of Laws Humeism: Reduction of Conditionals, Laws, and Powers Argument from scientific realism The extrinsicality objection and small worlds Objection based on induction  d Properties stages of Strong Powerism	78 84 86 90 92 94 94 99 100 102 103 105

1V
IA

		6.2.1 The causal theory of properties: causal structuralism	111
		6.2.2 Dual-aspect vs. mixed two-category theories	117
	6.3	Objections to Strong Powerism	118
	6.4	Conclusion	121
	Note	S	121
Pa	rt III	Universals and Particulars	
7	Univ	rersals	125
	7.1	Introduction	125
		7.1.1 What properties must explain	126
	7.2	Realism	128
		7.2.1 Troubles for Realism	129
	7.3	Universals and the Problem of Intentionality	142
		Properties as the Ground of Causal Powers	145
	Note	S	145
8	Redi	active Nominalism and Trope Theory	147
	8.1	Reductive Nominalism	147
		8.1.1 Predicate Nominalism	148
		8.1.2 Class Nominalism	149
		8.1.3 Resemblance Nominalism	152
	8.2	Trope Theory	165
		8.2.1 Two varieties of Trope Theory	167
		8.2.2 Some troubles for Trope Theory	167
	8.3	Conclusion	169
	Note	S	169
9	Part	iculars and the Problem of Individuation	171
	9.1	Introduction	171
	9.2	Facts	172
	9.3	Substances	175
		9.3.1 Relational Ontology	176
		9.3.2 Constituent Ontology	179
	Note	s	200
10	Rela	tions, Structures, and Quantities	201
	10.1	Accounts of Relational Facts	201
	10.2	Non-Symmetrical Relations and the Problem of Order	206
		10.2.1 The twin problems of converse relations	207
		10.2.2 Taking things in order	210
		10.2.3 A family of distinct, complex instantiation relations	210
		10.2.4 Constituent Ontologies and non-symmetric relations	211
		Structural Universals and Constituent Ontology	215
	10.4	Determinables, Quantities, and Real Numbers	219
		10.4.1 Determinate Universal Theory	220
		10.4.2 Simple Intensity Theory	221
		10.4.3 Composite Intensity Theory	224

x Contents

	10.5 Note		usion and Preview	225 225
	11010	•		220
Pa	rt IV	The	Nature of Reality	
11	Nihi	lism aı	nd Monism	229
	11.1	Nihilis	sm and Aliquidism	229
	11.2	Monis	m	237
		11.2.1	Parmenidean Monism	238
		11.2.2	Spinoza's Monism	240
		11.2.3	Bradley's Monism	243
		11.2.4	Jonathan Schaffer's Cosmic Monism	249
	Note			252
12	The	Non-E	existent and the Vaguely Existing	253
	12.1	Does I	Everything Exist?	253
		12.1.1	Meinong's Characterization Principle and Russell's theory of	
			descriptions	254
		12.1.2	Quantifiers and plural expressions	258
			Exportation and the Barcan Formula	260
		12.1.4	Arguments for Actualism	262
		12.1.5	Arguments against Actualism	266
		12.1.6	Defining existence	270
	12.2		Vagueness	271
			The multiple meaning theory of vagueness.	274
			Real ontological vagueness	275
			Can identity or existence be vague?	279
	12.3	Conclu	usion	280
13	Solip	osism, l	Idealism, and the Problem of Perception	281
			ng the Mental and the External	282
			ism and Phenomenalism	284
	13.3		ies of Perception	286
			The argument from hallucination and illusion	288
			The argument from colors	297
	13.4		nents against Phenomenalism	306
			What follows from the Veil of Perception?	306
			Common-sense and Scientific Realism	307
	10.5		The apparent impossibility of phenomenal reduction	308
	13.5	_	nents against Solipsism	309
			Appeals to common sense and to perception	309
	12.6		The Paradigm Case Argument against ubiquitous illusion	310
	Note		usion and Preview	312 313
	TAOLE	o		515
Par	rt V	Moda	ality	
14	Poss	ibility,	Necessity, and Actuality: Concretism	317
	14.1	Introd	uction	317
	14.2	Concre	etism: Worlds as Universes	321

Contents	xi	l

	14.3	Problems for Concretism	327
	14.4	Conclusion	331
	Note		331
15		ractionism: Worlds as Representations	332
	15.1	Magical Abstractionism	333
		15.1.1 Modal Anti-Indexicalism	334
		15.1.2 Non-indexical reductions of actuality	336
		15.1.3 A dilemma for Magical Abstractionism	339
	15.2	Structural Abstractionism	341
		15.2.1 Linguistic Abstractionism	342
		15.2.2 Pictorial Abstractionism	347
		Aristotelian Theories of Possibility	348
	15.4	Conclusion	350
	Note		351
16	De R	Re Modality and Modal Knowledge	352
10		Modality De Re: Transworld Identity and Counterpart Theory	352
	10.1	16.1.1 From Abstractionism to Transworld Identity	354
		16.1.2 From Concretism to Counterpart Theory	355
		16.1.3 Strong Transworld Identity and mere haecceitistic differences	360
		16.1.4 Summary	362
	16.2	Modality and Epistemology: Possibility and Conceivability	363
	10.2	16.2.1 Various notions of conceivability	363
		16.2.2 Objections to identifying the necessary and the a priori	364
		16.2.3 Knowledge of possibility: patchwork principles	367
		16.2.4 Aristotelian/Powerist conceptions of modal knowledge	368
	16 2	Conclusion	369
	Note		369
	Note	S	309
Pa	rt VI	Space and Time	
17	Is Sp	pace Merely Relational?	373
	17.1	The Nature of Location	373
	17.2	Spatial Substantivalism	375
		17.2.1 Theory of Spatial Qualities: Advantages and disadvantages	378
		17.2.2 Spatial Particularism: Distance as an essential but external relation	378
	17.3	Spatial Relationism	381
		Absences and Vacuums	386
	17.5	Conclusion	388
	Note	s	389
10	Sten	cture of Space: Points vs. Regions	390
10			390
	10.1	Constructing Points from Regions	391
	10.2	18.1.1 Digression on logical constructions	391
		Points vs. Regions Arguments against Points as Fundamental	394
	10.3	18.3.1 Finitism	398
		10.5.1 1 111113111	570

xii Contents

		18.3.2	Mathematical paradoxes, from Zeno to Tarski	402
		18.3.3	Spatial boundaries and physical contact	405
	18.4	Volum	inism vs. Volume-Boundary Dualism	408
		18.4.1	Continuous variation in quantity and quality	410
		18.4.2	Coincident boundaries: Actual vs. potential boundaries	413
	18.5	Conclu	ision	414
	Note			414
19	The	Structu	are of Time	415
			e Composed of Instants or Intervals?	415
			Argument for Instantism: Possible super-tasks	417
			Arguments for Intervalism: Impossible super-tasks	419
	19.2	Instant	s as Dependent Entities	425
			ime have a Beginning?	427
		Conclu		429
20	Tim	e's Pass	age	430
			s and Anti-Tensers	432
	20.2	Varieti	es of Anti-Tensism	435
		20.2.1	Reflexive thoughts and Old Anti-Tensism	435
			Indexical propositions and New Anti-Tensism	436
	20.3	Varieti	es of Tensism	437
	20.4	Presen	tism	439
	20.5	Argum	nents for Tensism	442
		20.5.1	The "Thank Goodness" Problem	442
		20.5.2	Evidence against indexicality: Parallels between 'now' and 'actually'	447
		20.5.3	The experience of the flow of time	448
		20.5.4	The present as a uniquely actual boundary between past and future	451
		20.5.5	The threat of fatalism	453
		20.5.6	Circular time and time travel	454
	20.6	Conclu	ision	456
	Note			457
21	Argı	ıments	for Anti-Tensism	458
	21.1	How F	ast Does Time Flow?	458
	21.2	Truthn	nakers for Truths about the Past	461
		21.2.1	Reductionistic Presentism or Occurentism	461
		21.2.2	Sui generis properties of present-day objects	461
		21.2.3	Primitive past-tensed facts or states of affairs.	462
		21.2.4	Rejection of Truthmaker Theory	463
		21.2.5	Truthmaker problems for Growing Block Tensism	463
		21.2.6	Further truthmaker problems: Cross-temporal spatial relations	
			(Motion)	464
		21.2.7	Truthmaker problems: Other cross-temporal relations between past	
			entities	466
		21.2.8	A final truthmaker problem for Presentism: Open-ended	
			generalizations	469
	21.3	The Th	peory of Relativity	469

		Contents	xiii
	21.4	Epistemological Problems for Tensism	473
		21.4.1 Does anybody really know what time it is?	473
		21.4.2 Everything we see is unreal	474
		21.4.3 The problem of induction	474
		McTaggart's Paradox	474
		Brute Necessities of Time	476
	21.7	Conclusion	478
Paı	rt VII	Unity	
22		erial Composition: The Special Question	481
		The Existence of Composite Things	482
		Are Composite Things an "Ontological Free Lunch"?	482
		Redundancy	485
	22.4	Fundamental Heaps	490
		22.4.1 Arguments against fundamental heaps	490
	22.5	22.4.2 An argument in favor of fundamental heaps: The possibility of gunk Fundamental Artifacts	494 497
	22.5		497
	22.6	22.5.1 Arguments against fundamental artifacts Living Organisms vs. Mereological Nihilism	499
	22.0	22.6.1 Arguments for fundamental living organisms	499
		22.6.2 Argument against fundamental living organisms: physicalism and	177
		emergent powers	502
		22.6.3 Mock Physicalism and the absorption of powers	503
	22.7	Finding an Intelligible Principle of Composition	504
		22.7.1 Is there a principle of composition?	504
		22.7.2 Do heaps exist?	506
		22.7.3 Do artifacts exist?	512
	Note	s	513
23	Con	position: The General Question	514
	23.1	Formal Mereology: Leśniewski, Goodman, and Leonard	514
	23.2	Three (or Four) Answers to the General Composition Question	518
	23.3	Accounting for the Correct Principles of Mereology	523
	23.4	Parthood and Truthmaking	529
	Note	s	530
24	Cha	nge and Persistence	531
		Does Anything Change? Does Anything Persist?	532
	24.2	How Objects Change Properties: Substratism vs. Replacementism	537
		24.2.1 Replacementism: reducing the persistent to the instantaneous	542
		24.2.2 Substratism vs. Classical Genidentity Theory	546
	24.3	The Metaphysics of Motion	551
		24.3.1 The At/At Theory vs. Intrinsic Motion	551
		24.3.2 The At/At Theory vs. Intervalism	553
	Note	s	554
25	The	Persistence of Composite Things	555
	25.1	Mereological Constancy and Inconstancy	556

xiv Contents

			Objections to inconstant things: Paradoxes of intransitive persistence	557
		25.1.2	Objections to inconstant things: Vagueness and conventionality	559
			Responses to the objections	560
	25.2		dent Things	564
			Composite things and their matter	565
			The grounding objection to coincidence	560
			Avoiding coincident entities: Nihilism and Near-Nihilism	568
			Avoiding coincidence through dominant sortals	568
			An Aristotelian solution to apparent coincidence	569
			Replacementist solutions: temporal counterparts	570
		Concl	ision	573
	Note	•		574
Pa	rt VI	II Ca	usation	
26	The	Exister	nce and Scope of Causation	577
	26.1	Are th	ere Causes?	577
		26.1.1	Arguments against Causal Realism	578
			Arguments for Causal Realism	579
	26.2		cope of Causation	583
			Arguments against Universal Causation	583
			Uncaused causes	585
	Note	:		589
27	Caus	sation:	A Relation between Things or Truths?	591
	27.1	Causal	Explanationism	592
		27.1.1	Objections to Causal Explanationism	595
	27.2	Causal	Connectionism	605
		27.2.1	Truthmakers and the relata of the causal connection	605
		27.2.2	Objection to Causal Connectionism: Negative causation	607
	Note	s		611
28	Disc	rete an	d Continuous Causation	613
	28.1	Is All C	Causation Discrete?	614
	28.2	The Na	ature of Discrete Causation	614
	28.3	Is All C	Causation Continuous?	616
	28.4	The Na	ature of Continuous Processes	618
			Reductive accounts of processes	618
		28.4.2	A non-reductive account	621
	28.5	Process	ses and the Direction of Continuous Causation	621
			ocesses an Exception to Hume's Epistemic Principle?	622
	28.7	Conclu	sion: The Consequences of Causation	623
	Note	s		623
29	Con	clusion	: The Four Packages	624
Аp	pend	ix A		
•	-			633

	Contents	XV
Appendix B		
•		651
References		655
Index		671