

Table of Contents

| | |
|---|----------|
| Introduction | 1 |
| <i>Elisabeth Steiner</i> | |
| Just Satisfaction under Art 41 ECHR: A Compromise in 1950 – Problematic Now | 3 |
| I. General Remarks and Origin of Art 41 | 3 |
| A. General | 3 |
| B. Origin of Art 41 | 4 |
| 1. Discussions at the Congress of Europe and in the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe | 5 |
| 2. Preparatory work at the intergovernmental level of the Council of Europe | 6 |
| 3. Criticism of art 50 | 8 |
| II. Characteristics of Art 41 | 9 |
| A. General Considerations | 9 |
| B. When Does Art 41 Apply? | 10 |
| 1. General | 10 |
| 2. Specific conditions | 11 |
| a) Only partial or lacking national reparation for the violation found by the Court | 11 |
| b) The Court considers it ‘necessary’ to afford just satisfaction | 12 |
| c) There is an ‘injured party’ | 13 |
| d) Causal link between the unlawful act and the injury sustained by the victim | 13 |
| e) Submission by the applicant of a claim for just satisfaction | 13 |
| C. Consequences of the Fulfillment of the Conditions of Art 41 | 13 |
| 1. Just satisfaction | 14 |
| 2. Damage covered by art 41 | 14 |
| a) Pecuniary damage | 14 |
| b) Non-pecuniary damage | 15 |
| c) Costs and expenses | 15 |
| III. Summary of the Main Features of the ECtHR’s Case-Law Relating to Art 41 | 15 |

| | |
|--|----|
| IV. Information on Comparable Provisions in Other International Human Rights Protection Systems | 17 |
| V. Application of Art 41 and Practical Difficulties | 18 |
| A. An Initially Modest Conception by the ECtHR of its Remedial Powers | 18 |
| B. Expansion of the Court's Remedial Powers Concerning Non-Pecuniary Reparations and Pilot Judgments | 19 |
| C. Requirement of Measures in Addition to the Payment of Just Satisfaction | 20 |
| D. Criticism Concerning Practice Regarding Art 41 | 20 |
| VI. Remedies and Main Reform Ideas | 22 |
| A. Attempts Made with the Court to Strive for Greater Consistency Regarding Art 41 | 22 |
| B. Action Taken at the Level of the Committee of Ministers and of Member States | 23 |
| C. Reform Proposals | 23 |
| VII. Issues for Further Discussion | 24 |
| VIII. Final Remarks | 26 |
| Fundamental Issues | 27 |
| <i>Franz Bydlinski †</i> | |
| Methodological Approaches to the Tort Law of the ECHR | 29 |
| I. Aims | 29 |
| II. Concerning the Method | 34 |
| III. The Rule in Art 41 ECHR and its Immanent Interpretation | 40 |
| IV. The Types of the Damage to be Compensated | 43 |
| A. Pecuniary Damage | 44 |
| B. 'Just Satisfaction' – Beyond Pecuniary and Non-Pecuniary Damage? | 44 |
| C. Costs and Expenses in Particular | 45 |
| D. Interest in Particular | 48 |
| E. Non-Pecuniary Damage | 50 |
| F. Restitution in Kind (Restoration) | 52 |
| V. Elements of the Violation and Ground for Liability | 54 |
| A. In General | 54 |
| B. Who is the State Liable for? | 56 |
| C. Reduction of the Burden of Proof in Imputation | 58 |
| D. Liability for Omissions | 59 |
| E. Omission and Lack of Money | 63 |
| F. The Applicability of Obligations to Third Parties ('Horizontal Effect') | 65 |

Table of Contents

| | | |
|--|--|-----|
| VI. | Persons Entitled to Compensation | 69 |
| A. | The Injured Parties | 69 |
| B. | Close Relatives. | 70 |
| VII. | The Causal Link | 72 |
| A. | In General | 72 |
| B. | The Individual Cases | 75 |
| 1. | Cases, in which the position on the causal link can be explained by the necessary condition formula (ie <i>conditio sine qua non</i>) | 76 |
| 2. | The 'direct' causal link | 78 |
| 3. | 'Prohibition on speculation' and lawful alternative action | 81 |
| 4. | Incomprehensible statements on the causal link | 89 |
| VIII. | The Extent of the Damages | 92 |
| A. | In General | 92 |
| B. | The Assessment Practice of the Court. | 93 |
| C. | The Court's Explicit or Implicit Rules of Assessment in the Case of Pecuniary Damage | 95 |
| D. | The Court's Explicit or Implicit Rules of Assessment in the Case of Non-Pecuniary Damage | 97 |
| E. | In Summary, Tort Law Evaluation and Supplementation | 103 |
| 1. | Assessment criteria for pecuniary damage | 103 |
| 2. | Evidence difficulties in the case of pecuniary damage | 105 |
| 3. | Specific aspects of non-pecuniary damage | 108 |
| IX. | The Finding of a Violation as Just Satisfaction? | 116 |
| A. | The Case-Law of the Court | 116 |
| B. | Commentary | 117 |
| C. | 'Discretion' of the Court also on the Merits? | 121 |
| X. | Results | 122 |
| Franz Bydlinski † | | |
| Methodologische Ansätze zum Schadenersatzrecht der EMRK | | 129 |
| I. | Aufgabenstellung | 129 |
| II. | Zur Methode | 135 |
| III. | Die Vorschrift des Art 41 EMRK und ihre immanente Auslegung | 141 |
| IV. | Die Arten des zu ersetzenenden Schadens. | 144 |
| A. | Vermögensschäden | 145 |
| B. | „Just satisfaction“ – jenseits von Vermögens- und Nichtvermögensschaden? | 145 |
| C. | Kosten und Aufwendungen insbesondere | 146 |
| D. | Zinsen insbesondere | 150 |
| E. | Der immaterielle Schaden (Nichtvermögensschaden) | 152 |
| F. | Naturalersatz (Wiederherstellung) | 154 |
| V. | Verletzungstatbestand und Haftungsgrund | 156 |
| A. | Im Allgemeinen | 156 |
| B. | Für wen haftet der Staat? | 158 |

| | | |
|--|--|-----|
| C. | Beweiserleichterungen bei der Zurechnung | 160 |
| D. | Haftung für Unterlassung | 162 |
| E. | Unterlassung und Geldmangel | 166 |
| F. | Zur Drittirkung („Horizontalwirkung“) | 168 |
| VI. | Die Schadenersatzberechtigten | 172 |
| A. | Die verletzten Personen | 172 |
| B. | Nahe Angehörige | 173 |
| VII. | Der Kausalzusammenhang | 175 |
| A. | Im Allgemeinen | 175 |
| B. | Die Judikatur im Einzelnen | 179 |
| | 1. Fälle, in denen die Stellungnahme zum Kausalzusammenhang mit der Bedingungsformel (also mit der <i>conditio sine qua non</i>) erklärt werden kann. | 180 |
| | 2. Der „direkte“ Kausalzusammenhang | 182 |
| | 3. „Spekulationsverbot“ und rechtmäßiges Alternativverhalten | 186 |
| | 4. Unverständliche Äußerungen zum Kausalzusammenhang | 195 |
| VIII. | Der Umfang des Schadenersatzes | 198 |
| A. | Im Allgemeinen | 198 |
| B. | Die Bemessungspraxis des Gerichtshofes | 199 |
| C. | Ausdrückliche oder implizite Bemessungsrichtlinien des Gerichtshofes bei Vermögensschäden | 201 |
| D. | Ausdrückliche oder implizite Bemessungsregeln des Gerichtshofes bei immateriellen Schäden | 203 |
| E. | Zusammenfassende schadenersatzrechtliche Würdigung und Ergänzung | 209 |
| | 1. Bemessungskriterien beim Vermögensschaden | 209 |
| | 2. Beweisschwierigkeiten beim Vermögensschaden | 212 |
| | 3. Besonderheiten des immateriellen Schadens | 215 |
| IX. | Die Feststellung der Rechtsverletzung als gerechte Genugtuung? | 224 |
| A. | Die Rechtsprechung des Gerichtshofes | 224 |
| B. | Stellungnahme | 225 |
| C. | „Ermessen“ des Gerichtshofes auch dem Grunde nach? | 229 |
| X. | Ergebnisse | 231 |
| <i>Walter Berka</i> | | |
| Human Rights and Tort Law | | 237 |
| I. | Introduction | 237 |
| II. | Fundamental Rights and Tort Law | 242 |
| A. | On the Guarantee Principally Embodied in Fundamental Rights: the Obligation to Respect Fundamental Rights | 242 |
| B. | Tort Law and Fundamental Rights | 246 |
| C. | National and Legal-Policy Margins of Appreciation | 249 |

Table of Contents

| | | |
|--|--|-----|
| III. | Compensation in the Case of State Infringements of Fundamental Rights | 251 |
| A. | Starting Points for Damage Liability Founded in Fundamental Rights | 251 |
| B. | On the Right to Compensation in the Case of Infringement of Personal Freedom (Art 5 Para 5 ECHR) | 254 |
| C. | On the Right to Compensation in the Case of Miscarriages of Justice (Art 3 7th Protocol to the ECHR) | 256 |
| D. | Rights to Compensation for Infringements of Other Fundamental Rights | 257 |
| E. | On State Liability for Fundamental Rights Infringements | 265 |
| IV. | Liability Claims Arising out of State Obligations to Protect | 266 |
| A. | On the Fundamental Rights-Based Obligations to Protect | 266 |
| B. | Claims for Compensation and State Obligations to Protect: the Legislator's Duty to Act | 268 |
| C. | Concretisation of Obligations to Protect by the Case-Law | 271 |
| 1. | Non-pecuniary damages in the case of deprivation of liberty by private persons | 272 |
| 2. | The gaps in the compensation of non-pecuniary damage | 272 |
| 3. | Entitlements in the case of infringements of absolute personality rights | 273 |
| 4. | On the application of fundamental rights considerations in decisions on claims to compensation | 274 |
| 5. | Wrongful conception and wrongful birth – a fundamental rights problem? | 276 |
| V. | Liability Claims as Infringements of Fundamental Rights | 279 |
| A. | Change of Perspective | 279 |
| B. | Tort Claims and the Principle of Proportionality | 280 |
| C. | Compensation for Lawful Exercise of Fundamental Rights? | 283 |
| D. | Ruinous Damages Awards | 285 |
| VI. | Summarising Conclusions: Human Rights and Tort Law | 287 |
| Walter Berka | | |
| Menschenrechte und Schadenersatzrecht | | 289 |
| I. | Einleitung | 289 |
| II. | Grundrechte und Schadenersatzrecht | 295 |
| A. | Zum prinzipiellen Gewährleistungsgehalt der Grundrechte: der grundrechtliche Achtungsanspruch | 295 |
| B. | Schadenersatz und Grundrechte | 298 |
| C. | Nationale und rechtspolitische Ausgestaltungsspielräume | 301 |
| III. | Schadenersatz bei staatlichen Grundrechtseingriffen | 304 |
| A. | Ansatzpunkte für eine grundrechtlich begründete Schadenshaftung | 304 |
| B. | Zum Entschädigungsanspruch bei Eingriffen in die persönliche Freiheit (Art 5 Abs 5 EMRK) | 307 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| C. Zum Entschädigungsanspruch bei Fehlurteilen (Art 37. ZPEMRK) | 309 |
| D. Schadenersatzansprüche bei Eingriffen in andere Grundrechte . | 310 |
| E. Zur Staatshaftung für Grundrechtseingriffe | 318 |
| IV. Haftungsansprüche aus staatlichen Schutzpflichten | 320 |
| A. Zu den grundrechtlichen Schutzpflichten | 320 |
| B. Schadenersatzansprüche und staatliche Schutzpflichten: Handlungspflichten des Gesetzgebers | 322 |
| C. Konkretisierung von Schutzpflichten durch die Rechtsprechung | 326 |
| 1. Immaterieller Schadenersatz bei Freiheitsberaubung durch Private | 326 |
| 2. Die Lückenhaftigkeit beim Ersatz immaterieller Schäden . | 327 |
| 3. Ansprüche bei Eingriffen in absolute Persönlichkeitsrechte . | 328 |
| 4. Zur Heranziehung grundrechtlicher Wertungen bei der Entscheidung über Schadenersatzansprüche | 329 |
| 5. Wrongful conception und wrongful birth – ein Grundrechtsproblem? | 331 |
| V. Haftungsansprüche als Grundrechtseingriffe | 334 |
| A. Ein Perspektivenwechsel | 334 |
| B. Schadenersatzansprüche und Übermaßverbot | 335 |
| C. Schadenersatz für rechtmäßigen Grundrechtsgebrauch? | 338 |
| D. Ruinöse Schadenersatzforderungen | 341 |
| VI. Zusammenfassende Schlussfolgerungen: Menschenrechte und Schadenersatzrecht | 343 |

Wolfram Karl

'Just Satisfaction' in Art 41 ECHR and Public International Law

| | |
|--|-----|
| - Issues of Interpretation and Review of International Materials | 345 |
| I. Introduction: The European Convention on Human Rights as Part of Public International Law | 345 |
| II. Interpreting the European Convention on Human Rights | 346 |
| A. Treaty Interpretation under Public International Law | 346 |
| B. Special Aspects of the Interpretation of the European Convention on Human Rights. | 349 |
| III. Elements for the Interpretation of Art 41 ECHR | 349 |
| A. The Wording of Art 41 (ex Art 50) ECHR and its Drafting History | 350 |
| B. The Principle of Effectiveness ('Object and Purpose') | 355 |
| C. Subsequent Practice (Art 31 Para 2(b) VCLT) | 356 |
| D. Art 31 Para 3(c) VCLT: '... any relevant rules of international law applicable in the relations between the parties' | 356 |
| E. Comparative Interpretation – National Laws | 359 |
| F. Comparative Interpretation – Other International Instruments . | 361 |

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|-----|
| IV. Pertinent Rules of General International Law | 364 |
| A. Preliminary Remark | 364 |
| B. Customary International Law on Reparation | 364 |
| 1. The ILC Articles on State Responsibility of 2001 | 365 |
| 2. Contents of state responsibility | 365 |
| 3. <i>Lex specialis</i> and ‘self-contained regimes’ | 368 |
| C. General Principles of Law | 370 |
| 1. General principles of law as a source of international law | 370 |
| 2. General principles of law within the context of the European Convention | 372 |
| V. Materials for Comparative Interpretation: Other International Schemes for Reparation | 373 |
| A. Inter-State Claims based on the Diplomatic Protection of Nationals | 374 |
| B. Claims by Individuals before Claims Tribunals and Claims Commissions | 375 |
| 1. Iran-US Claims Tribunal | 376 |
| 2. International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID) and tribunals set up under its auspices | 376 |
| 3. United Nations Compensation Commission (UNCC) and Eritrea-Ethiopia Claims Commission (EECC) | 377 |
| C. Claims before (other) Human Rights Institutions | 378 |
| 1. The United Nations Basic Principles and Guidelines on the Right to Remedy and Reparation (2005) | 378 |
| 2. The United Nations Treaty-Bodies | 379 |
| 3. The Inter-American Court of Human Rights | 382 |
| D. Claims before International Criminal Courts | 383 |
| VI. Conclusions | 384 |
| <i>Michel de Salvia</i> Can the Reparation Awarded to Victims of Violations under the ECHR be Considered a Real ‘Just’ Satisfaction? | 387 |
| Special Topics | 395 |
| <i>Ken Oliphant and Katarzyna Ludwichowska</i> Damage | 397 |
| First Part: Analysis of the ECtHR Jurisprudence | 397 |
| I. General Requirements in Respect of Damage | 400 |
| A. Proof of Damage | 400 |
| B. Certainty of Damage | 403 |
| C. Legitimacy of Damage | 406 |

| | | |
|---|--|-----|
| II. | Pecuniary and Non-Pecuniary Damage | 407 |
| A. | Pecuniary Damage | 408 |
| 1. | Damnum emergens | 408 |
| 2. | Lucrum cessans | 411 |
| 3. | Loss of opportunities | 412 |
| 4. | Interest | 412 |
| B. | Non-Pecuniary Damage | 413 |
| III. | Protected Rights and Interests | 416 |
| A. | General | 416 |
| B. | Rights and Interests in the Person | 417 |
| 1. | Life | 417 |
| 2. | Physical and mental integrity | 419 |
| a) | Right to life (art 2) | 419 |
| b) | Torture and inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment (art 3) | 420 |
| c) | The right to respect for private life (art 8) | 421 |
| d) | Consequential damage | 422 |
| 3. | Liberty | 422 |
| 4. | The right to private and family life | 425 |
| a) | Private life | 426 |
| b) | Family life | 428 |
| c) | Home | 429 |
| d) | Correspondence | 432 |
| 5. | Reputation | 432 |
| 6. | Other personality interests | 433 |
| 7. | Personal freedoms | 433 |
| C. | Property Rights | 434 |
| 1. | Meaning of ‘possessions’ | 434 |
| 2. | Title | 435 |
| 3. | Expectations and claims | 436 |
| 4. | Forms of interference | 437 |
| 5. | Pecuniary damage | 438 |
| 6. | Non-pecuniary damage | 439 |
| D. | Pure Economic Interests | 440 |
| 1. | General | 440 |
| 2. | Economic assets as possessions | 441 |
| Second Part: Comparative Remarks | | 441 |
| I. | General Observations | 441 |
| II. | Specific Aspects | 443 |
| A. | General Requirements in Respect of Damage | 443 |
| B. | Pecuniary and Non-Pecuniary Damage | 444 |
| C. | Protected Rights and Interests | 446 |
| III. | Conclusion | 447 |

Markus Kellner and Isabelle C Durant

| | |
|--|-----|
| Causation | 449 |
| First Part: Analysis of the ECtHR Jurisprudence | 449 |
| I. Introduction | 449 |
| II. General Remarks on the Analysis of the Case-Law | 451 |
| A. Substantiation of the Claim | 451 |
| B. Facts of the Case | 452 |
| C. Rationes Decidendi | 453 |
| III. The Requirement of ‘Clear Causation’ | 455 |
| IV. Conditio sine qua non | 457 |
| A. Use of the ‘Conditio sine qua non’ Test | 457 |
| B. Non Revealed Causal Test | 461 |
| C. Onus of Proof | 464 |
| V. Scope of Liability | 466 |
| A. Fundamental Idea | 466 |
| B. Case-Law | 467 |
| 1. ‘Clear causal link’ | 467 |
| 2. ‘Direct causal link’ | 468 |
| 3. ‘Sufficient causal link’ | 469 |
| 4. Further qualifications and criteria | 470 |
| 5. The case of <i>Mascolo c. Italie</i> – does only an <i>exclusive</i> cause incur liability? | 471 |
| C. Summary | 473 |
| VI. Causation and the Violation of Procedural Guarantees | 474 |
| A. The Problem | 474 |
| B. Case-Law | 477 |
| 1. The approaches found | 477 |
| a) The irrelevance of the hypothetical outcome – full compensation? | 477 |
| b) ‘Prohibition on speculation’ rule – no compensation | 478 |
| c) ‘Loss of (real) opportunities’ – partial compensation | 484 |
| 2. Attempts at reconciliation | 485 |
| a) Probability of triumphing in domestic proceedings? | 486 |
| b) Type and quality of the procedural right infringed? | 489 |
| c) Suitability of the damage for assessment? | 489 |
| d) Equity? | 490 |
| e) <i>Kingsley v. the United Kingdom</i> [GC] – does the Court speculate after all? | 490 |
| VII. Conclusion | 491 |
| Second Part: Comparative Remarks | 493 |
| I. The Requirement of Causation and the Conditio sine qua non | 493 |
| II. Scope of Liability | 493 |
| A. The Fundamental Idea: A Flexible Borderline | 493 |
| B. Relevant Factors | 494 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| C. Conclusion | 495 |
| III. Causation and the Violation of Procedural Guarantees | 495 |
| A. The Problem | 495 |
| B. The Approaches Found | 496 |
| 1. Proving causation | 496 |
| 2. Perte d'une chance | 497 |
| 3. Alternative causation per analogiam | 497 |
| 4. Co-existence of several approaches | 498 |
| C. Dogmatic Categories | 498 |
| D. Conclusion | 500 |
| <i>Barbara C Steininger and Nora Wallner-Friedl</i> | |
| Wrongfulness and Fault | 501 |
| I. Introduction | 501 |
| A. Differences in the National Tort Law Systems | 502 |
| 1. Conduct or result as starting point | 502 |
| 2. Main functions of ‘wrongfulness’ and ‘fault’ | 503 |
| B. Wrongfulness and Fault under Art 41 ECHR | 504 |
| 1. Subjective factors | 505 |
| 2. Protected interests and required standard of conduct | 506 |
| II. Analysis of the ECtHR Jurisprudence | 508 |
| A. General | 508 |
| B. Analysis of Violations of Different Convention Rights through Active Conduct | 509 |
| 1. Art 2 ECHR | 509 |
| 2. Art 3 ECHR | 511 |
| 3. Art 8 ECHR | 515 |
| 4. Art 1 Protocol No 1 | 517 |
| C. Violation of Convention Rights through Omissions | 519 |
| 1. Art 2 ECHR | 520 |
| 2. Art 3 ECHR | 521 |
| 3. Art 8 ECHR | 522 |
| 4. Reasonable time requirement of art 6 ECHR | 524 |
| 5. Conclusions | 527 |
| D. Lack of Resources and the Required Standard of Conduct | 527 |
| E. Jurisdiction | 531 |
| 1. The Assanidze case | 531 |
| 2. Implications | 532 |
| III. Comparative Remarks | 533 |
| IV. Conclusions | 536 |

Table of Contents

Jörg Fedtke

| | |
|--|-----|
| Protective Purpose of the Rule | 539 |
| First Part: Analysis of the ECtHR Jurisprudence | 539 |
| I. Introduction | 539 |
| II. The Protective Purpose of the Rule in the Jurisprudence of the ECtHR | 546 |
| A. The Scope of Protection in Human Rights Cases | 546 |
| B. The Protective Purpose of a Rule as a Separate Element of Inquiry | 547 |
| 1. Practical and effective safeguards | 547 |
| 2. Positive obligations | 558 |
| 3. Standards of international law | 559 |
| 4. Proportionality | 560 |
| C. Conclusions | 561 |
| Second Part: Comparative Remarks | 563 |

Dagmar Hinghofer-Szalkay and Bernhard A Koch

| | |
|--|-----|
| No-Fault or Strict Liability | 567 |
| I. Introduction | 567 |
| II. Analysis of the ECtHR Jurisprudence and the Literature | 571 |
| A. Jurisprudence | 571 |
| B. Literature | 574 |
| III. ECtHR Jurisprudence Compared | 575 |
| IV. Conclusions | 577 |

Christa Kissling and Denis Kelliher

| | |
|---|-----|
| Compensation for Pecuniary and Non-Pecuniary Loss | 579 |
| First Part: Analysis of the ECtHR Jurisprudence | 579 |
| I. Preliminary Remarks | 579 |
| A. Content and Interpretation of Art 41 ECHR with Regard to the Compensation for Pecuniary and Non-Pecuniary Loss | 579 |
| B. Categories of Damages | 583 |
| C. General Remarks on Compensation for both Pecuniary and Non-Pecuniary Loss | 584 |
| 1. Equity as a governing principle | 584 |
| 2. Discretion of the ECtHR and global amounts for compensation in respect of pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage | 585 |
| 3. Damages must be claimed | 587 |

| | | |
|------|---|-----|
| II. | Compensation for Pecuniary Loss | 588 |
| A. | Explicit or Implicit Rules for the Compensation for Pecuniary Loss | 588 |
| 1. | Full compensation | 588 |
| 2. | Impact of the seriousness of a violation of the Convention on compensation for pecuniary damage | 589 |
| 3. | Evidentiary difficulties | 589 |
| B. | Compensation of Damage to Existing Individual Interests (Damnum Emergens) | 590 |
| 1. | Compensation of reasonable expenses | 590 |
| 2. | Compensation of loss of maintenance for dependants of the deceased ('Versorgungsschaden') | 591 |
| 3. | Compensation for loss of property | 596 |
| a) | Expropriated property | 596 |
| b) | Destruction of property | 602 |
| c) | Confiscation | 603 |
| d) | Judgment debts | 604 |
| 4. | Loss of career prospects | 605 |
| 5. | Domestic fines and awards | 605 |
| C. | Compensation for Loss of Income (Lucrum Cessans) | 606 |
| D. | Victim of a Violation and Corporate Personality | 610 |
| E. | Conclusions on Compensation for Pecuniary Loss | 613 |
| III. | Compensation for Non-Pecuniary Loss | 615 |
| A. | General Remarks | 615 |
| B. | Explicit or Implicit General Rules of Assessment in Cases of Non-Pecuniary Damage | 621 |
| 1. | No precise calculation of non-pecuniary damage | 621 |
| 2. | Domestic practice is not binding | 622 |
| 3. | (Limited) duty to follow previous ECtHR judgments | 623 |
| 4. | Agreement by the respondent State | 624 |
| 5. | Assessment of damages for non-pecuniary loss 'on an equitable basis' | 624 |
| C. | A Few Concrete Criteria for Assessing Damages for Non-Pecuniary Loss | 626 |
| 1. | Relevance of the seriousness of the violation of the Convention | 627 |
| 2. | Relevance of the seriousness and duration of the injury | 628 |
| 3. | Personal characteristics of the applicant (eg age, state of health) | 631 |
| 4. | Relevance of standard of living and economic indicators in the applicant's country | 632 |
| 5. | Behaviour of the victim | 634 |

Table of Contents

| | |
|---|-----|
| D. Criteria and Awarded Amounts with Regard to Different Violated Convention Rights – Cases | 634 |
| 1. Violation of art 2 ECHR (right to life) | 635 |
| a) Overview of the judgments detailed below | 635 |
| b) Judgments (in detail) | 638 |
| 2. Violation of art 3 ECHR (prohibition of torture) | 644 |
| a) Direct victim is applying for non-pecuniary damage | 644 |
| b) Violation of art 3 ECHR in respect of relatives of disappeared persons who are presumed dead by the ECtHR | 647 |
| 3. Violation of art 5 ECHR (right to liberty and security) | 649 |
| a) Violation of art 5(1) ECHR (right to liberty and security) – Duration of the unlawful detention | 649 |
| b) Violation of art 5(1) ECHR (right to liberty and security), art 18 ECHR (limitation on use of restrictions on rights) and art 34 ECHR (individual applications) | 650 |
| c) Violation of art 5(1) ECHR (right to liberty and security), art 5(4) ECHR (right to take proceedings by which the lawfulness of the detention shall be decided speedily by a court) and art 5(5) ECHR (enforceable right to compensation) | 651 |
| d) Violation of art 5(3) ECHR (right to trial within a reasonable time or to release pending trial) | 652 |
| e) Violation of art 5(3) ECHR (right to be brought promptly before a judge) and art 5(4) ECHR (right to take proceedings by which the lawfulness of the detention shall be decided speedily by a court) | 654 |
| 4. Violation of art 6(1) ECHR (right of access to court) | 655 |
| a) Unreasonable length of proceedings | 655 |
| b) Failure of the authorities to properly and/or timely enforce a judgment in the applicant's favour | 670 |
| c) Numerous applicants | 672 |
| 5. Violation of art 8 ECHR (right to respect for private and family life) | 673 |
| 6. Violation of art 14 ECHR (prohibition of discrimination) in conjunction with art 8 ECHR (right to respect for private and family life) | 675 |
| E. Conclusions on Compensation for Non-Pecuniary Loss | 678 |
| Second Part: Comparative Remarks | 680 |
| I. Comparative Remarks on Compensation for Pecuniary Loss | 680 |
| A. General Remarks | 680 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| B. Compensation and Expropriated Property <i>(Guiso-Gallisay v. Italy)</i> | 682 |
| 1. Preliminary remarks | 682 |
| 2. International law perspective on the distinction between lawful and unlawful expropriations | 683 |
| 3. International law perspective on the amount of compensation for lawful and unlawful expropriations | 685 |
| 4. Conclusions | 687 |
| II. Comparative Remarks on Compensation for Non-Pecuniary Loss | 687 |
| A. General Remarks | 688 |
| 1. Acceptance of compensation for non-pecuniary loss in national law and range of cases | 688 |
| 2. Survival of the right to claim for compensation in respect of non-pecuniary loss | 693 |
| 3. Compensation for non-pecuniary loss to third parties (relatives, secondary victims) | 695 |
| 4. Compensation for non-pecuniary loss for legal entities or organisations | 701 |
| 5. Global amounts for compensation in respect of pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage | 702 |
| B. General Principles: Equity and Discretion | 703 |
| 1. Equity | 703 |
| 2. Discretion | 704 |
| C. The ECtHR's Concrete Criteria for the Assessment of Compensation for Non-Pecuniary Loss in Comparison with Domestic Laws | 706 |
| 1. Interplay between objective and subjective criteria | 706 |
| 2. Assessment criteria of the ECtHR in comparison with criteria addressed at the domestic level and in the PETL | 707 |
| 3. Standard of living | 711 |
| 4. Tariffs and tables | 713 |
| a) Tables and compilations based on national court practice | 713 |
| b) Legislative tariffs | 720 |
| D. Conclusions | 721 |
| <i>Vanessa Wilcox</i> | |
| Punitive and Nominal Damages | 725 |
| First Part: Analysis of the ECtHR Jurisprudence | 725 |
| I. Introduction | 725 |
| II. Punitive Damages | 726 |
| A. Nature and Aims | 726 |
| B. Punitive Damages under the ECtHR | 726 |
| 1. Convention and Practice Direction | 726 |

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|-----|
| 2. Case law analysis | 727 |
| 3. Punitive v aggravated damages | 729 |
| 4. Compensation scales and adjustments of just satisfaction awards | 729 |
| C. Protecting Convention Rights through Supervisory Measures and other Human Rights Institutes of the Council of Europe | 730 |
| D. Conclusion | 731 |
| III. Nominal Damages | 732 |
| A. Nature and Aims | 732 |
| B. Nominal Damages under the ECtHR | 733 |
| 1. Convention and Practice Direction | 733 |
| 2. Case law analysis | 733 |
| C. Conclusion | 736 |
| Second Part: Comparative Remarks | 737 |
| I. Punitive Damages | 738 |
| II. Nominal Damages | 739 |
| Mónika Józon | |
| Satisfaction by Finding a Violation | 741 |
| First Part: Analysis of the ECtHR Jurisprudence | 741 |
| I. Introduction | 741 |
| II. Assessment of the Court's Case Law (1992–2009) | 742 |
| A. The Value of the Harm Suffered and the Low Amount of Damages Claimed | 747 |
| B. Applicant's Attitude during Proceedings | 747 |
| C. Breach of National Laws by Applicant | 748 |
| D. Nature of Breach Committed by Respondent State | 749 |
| E. Lack of Deprivation of Liberty | 752 |
| F. Refusal to Speculate as to the Outcome of the Case | 753 |
| G. Violations of Specific Provisions of the Convention | 754 |
| H. The Mixed Approach Cases | 758 |
| III. Declaratory Judgments as Just Satisfaction for both Pecuniary and Non-Pecuniary Damages: The Coming of a New Era in the Court's Approach to Compensation? | 759 |
| IV. Cases where, in the Court's View, Declaratory Judgments Would not Suffice | 761 |
| V. Conclusion | 763 |
| Second Part: Comparative Remarks | 765 |

Vanessa Wilcox and Olaf Riss

| | |
|--|-----|
| Contributory Negligence | 771 |
| First Part: Analysis of the ECtHR Jurisprudence | 771 |
| I. Introduction | 771 |
| II. Contributory Negligence in Outline | 771 |
| A. Terminology | 772 |
| B. General Conditions | 772 |
| III. Contributory Conduct under the Convention and the Practice | |
| Direction on Just Satisfaction Claims | 773 |
| IV. The Applicant's Conduct under Art 6 ECHR | 774 |
| A. Standard of Conduct and Fault | 775 |
| 1. Categories of conduct | 776 |
| a) Adjournments | 776 |
| b) Absenteeism | 777 |
| c) Interrupting proceedings | 777 |
| d) Omissions | 778 |
| e) Failure to expedite proceedings | 778 |
| 2. Capacity | 779 |
| B. Causation and Apportionment | 780 |
| 1. No finding of a violation | 780 |
| 2. A finding of a violation to amount to sufficient just satisfaction | 782 |
| 3. A reduction in the award of damages | 783 |
| 4. Making an assessment on an equitable basis | 783 |
| C. Conclusion | 784 |
| V. Contributory Negligence and Cases under the ECtHR: | |
| Other Articles | 786 |
| A. The Right to Life (Art 2) | 786 |
| 1. No finding of a violation | 788 |
| 2. Dismissal of damages claim | 789 |
| 3. Award of damages | 790 |
| 4. Imputation of acts of third persons as contributory conduct and contributing conduct and third party claims | 791 |
| 5. Conclusion | 792 |
| B. Prohibition of Torture (Art 3) | 792 |
| C. Protection of Property (Art 1 of Protocol No 1) | 795 |
| Second Part: Comparative Remarks | 798 |
| I. The Recognition of and Justification for Contributory Negligence in ECHR Signatory Jurisdictions | 798 |
| II. Capacity | 799 |
| III. Third Parties | 800 |
| A. The Imputation of Acts of Third Persons as Contributory Fault | 800 |
| B. Contributory Conduct and Third Party Claims | 801 |
| IV. Conclusion | 801 |

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|-----|
| <i>Thomas Thiede and Erdem Büyüksagis</i> | |
| Reduction of Damages | 803 |
| I. Preliminary Remarks | 803 |
| A. Reduction of Damages in National and European Tort Law | 803 |
| B. Principles Governing the Reduction of Damages. | 805 |
| II. Analysis of the ECtHR Jurisprudence | 806 |
| A. Incapacity and <i>Vis Maior</i> | 808 |
| 1. <i>Assanidze v. Georgia</i> [GC] | 808 |
| 2. <i>Mykhaylenky and Others v. Ukraine</i> | 810 |
| B. Benefits Received and Risks Taken | 812 |
| C. Contributory Conduct or Activity | 813 |
| 1. <i>Rehbock v. Slovenia</i> and <i>Wenerski v. Poland</i> | 814 |
| 2. <i>Sabin Popescu c. Roumanie</i> | 815 |
| 3. <i>Musiat v. Poland</i> [GC] | 816 |
| D. Prohibition on Speculation | 819 |
| III. Conclusions | 820 |
| Concluding Remarks | 823 |
| <i>Helmut Koziol</i> | |
| Concluding Remarks Regarding the Methods of Interpreting Art 41 ECHR | 825 |
| I. Franz Bydlinski's Approach | 825 |
| II. Wolfram Karl's Position | 827 |
| III. Concluding Remarks | 827 |
| <i>Ernst Karner</i> | |
| Concluding Remarks on Damage | 829 |
| I. Foundations of the Concept of Damage | 829 |
| II. Autonomous Concept of Damage and Protected Interests | 832 |
| III. Summary Remarks | 834 |
| <i>Ernst Karner</i> | |
| Concluding Remarks on Causation | 835 |
| I. Starting Point | 835 |
| II. Different Issues – Natural and Legal Causation | 836 |
| III. ECHR and Causation | 837 |
| A. General | 837 |
| B. Particular Problems in the Case of Violation of Procedural Guarantees | 838 |
| <i>Attila Fenyves</i> | |
| Concluding Remarks on Wrongfulness and Fault | 843 |

Ernst Karner

| | |
|---|-----|
| Concluding Remarks on the Protective Purpose of the Rule | 851 |
| I. Starting Point | 851 |
| II. Protective Purpose Aspects in the Case-Law of the Court? | 852 |
| III. Final Remarks | 854 |

Ernst Karner

| | |
|---|-----|
| Concluding Remarks on No-Fault or Strict Liability | 857 |
| I. Grounds for Liability and Explanation of Terminology | 857 |
| II. Classification of Liability under Art 41 ECHR | 858 |
| III. Conclusion | 861 |

Helmut Koziol

| | |
|---|-----|
| Concluding Remarks on Compensatory and Non-Compensatory Remedies | 863 |
| I. Introduction | 863 |
| II. Compensation for Pecuniary Loss | 864 |
| A. Principle of Full Compensation | 864 |
| B. Assessment of Compensation for Pecuniary Loss | 865 |
| III. Compensation for Non-Pecuniary Loss | 866 |
| A. Recoverability of Non-Pecuniary Loss | 866 |
| B. Compensation for Non-Pecuniary Loss in all Cases of Infringements of Fundamental Rights? | 867 |
| C. Compensation in Kind or Compensation in Money? | 869 |
| D. Finding of a Violation and Nominal Damages as Type of Compensation in Kind? | 869 |
| E. Compensation in Money | 872 |
| IV. Punitive Damages | 874 |

Attila Fenyves

| | |
|---|-----|
| Concluding Remarks on Contributory Negligence and Reduction Clause | 877 |
|---|-----|

| | |
|------------------------|-----|
| Index | 885 |
|------------------------|-----|

| | |
|-------------------------------|-----|
| Publications | 899 |
|-------------------------------|-----|