



# Contents

<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvii
<i>Bibliographical Note</i>	xix

Introduction	1
--------------	---

## PART I FOUNDATIONS

1. Practice: The Rise of Article 2 TEU in the Court's Jurisprudence	11
2. Doctrine: The Judicial Applicability of Article 2 TEU	33
3. Theory: The Dual Character of Article 2 TEU	69

## PART II 'THE UNION IS FOUNDED ON THE VALUES . . .': POTENTIAL IN THE EU DIMENSION

4. Article 2 TEU as Constitutional Core of the EU Legal Order	87
5. The Court and the Treaties: Fostering Coherence	107
6. The Court and the Legislature: Encouraging Legislation	125
7. The Court and the Treaty Makers: Constraining Treaty Revision	145

## PART III 'THESE VALUES ARE COMMON TO THE MEMBER STATES . . .': POTENTIAL IN THE VERBUND DIMENSION

8. Article 2 TEU as Constitutional Frame of the Verbund	165
9. Top-Down Review	183
10. Horizontal Review	203
11. Bottom-Up Review	223

PART IV RISKS AND RECALIBRATION

12. Towards a Tyranny of EU Values?	243
13. Disrupting the Federal Balance?	265
Conclusions	291
<i>Bibliography</i>	297
<i>Index</i>	351

# Detailed Contents

<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvii
<i>Bibliographical Note</i>	xix

Introduction	1
I. Objectives	2
II. Focus	3
III. Structure	4
IV. Method	6

## PART I FOUNDATIONS

1. Practice: The Rise of Article 2 TEU in the Court's Jurisprudence	11
I. Introduction	11
II. Emergence	11
A. From Rome to Amsterdam: Initial Neglect	11
B. From Amsterdam to Lisbon: Growing Engagement	14
III. Breakthrough: <i>Associação Sindical dos Juizes Portugueses</i>	19
A. Innovation	22
B. Reception	24
IV. Spread	26
A. Procedural Extension	27
B. Substantive Extension	28
2. Doctrine: The Judicial Applicability of Article 2 TEU	33
I. Introduction	33
II. Legal Normativity	33
A. Text	36
1. Principles and values: The blurry lines of legal theory	37
2. Principles and values: Comparative considerations	39
3. Principles and values: The shifting Treaty semantics	40
B. System	41
C. History	42
1. The emergence of values in EU law	43
2. The Convention on the Future of Europe	45
D. Values as Normative Reinforcement?	47
III. Justiciability	47
A. Current Practice: Operationalizing Article 2 TEU Through Specific Provisions	50

B. Future Outlook: Towards a Freestanding Application of Article 2 TEU?	52
1. Negative approach	53
2. Positive approach	54
IV. Jurisdiction	59
A. No General Exclusivity of Political Procedures	62
B. No Partial Exclusivity of Political Procedures Beyond the Scope of EU Law	63
3. Theory: The Dual Character of Article 2 TEU	69
I. Introduction	69
II. Premises	69
A. A Constitutional Approach	69
B. A Multidimensional Approach	71
III. The Dual Character of Article 2 TEU	74
A. Verbund Dimension: Article 2 TEU as Manifestation of a Thin Constitutionalism	77
B. EU Dimension: Article 2 TEU as Manifestation of a Thick Constitutionalism	79
IV. Summing Up	83
PART II ‘THE UNION IS FOUNDED ON THE VALUES . . .’: POTENTIAL IN THE EU DIMENSION	
4. Article 2 TEU as Constitutional Core of the EU Legal Order	87
I. Introduction	87
II. In Search of the Union’s Constitution	89
A. Jurisprudence	89
B. Scholarship	91
III. Towards an Article 2 TEU-based Constitution	92
A. Method	93
B. Contours	95
IV. Effect: Substantive Hierarchies in EU Primary Law	99
5. The Court and the Treaties: Fostering Coherence	107
I. Introduction	107
II. Establishing Coherence in Primary Law	108
A. Limited Instruments	109
B. Outdated Outcomes	110
III. The Potential of Article 2 TEU	113
A. The Court in Search for Coherence: Objectives and Principles	113
B. Fostering Coherence by Recourse to Article 2 TEU	116
1. Potential for interpretation	117
2. Potential for conflict resolution	121

6. The Court and the Legislature: Encouraging Legislation	125
I. Introduction	125
II. An Overly Constrained EU Legislature	126
A. The Treaty Level: Extensive Primary Law	127
B. The Institutional Level: A Strong Court of Justice	128
III. The Potential of Article 2 TEU	132
A. The Court Between Responsiveness and Resistance	133
B. From ‘Over’ to ‘De-constitutionalization’	137
7. The Court and the Treaty Makers: Constraining Treaty Revision	145
I. Introduction	145
II. Unconstrained Treaty Makers?	147
A. Explicit Procedural but Implicit Substantive Constraints?	147
B. The Court’s Enigmatic Position	148
III. The Potential of Article 2 TEU	150
A. Article 2 TEU as a Justiciable Limit of Treaty Revisions?	150
1. Substantive limitations	150
2. Justiciability	155
B. Potential Objections	158
1. Primary and secondary constituent power in the EU	158
2. The dead hand of the past	161

PART III ‘THESE VALUES ARE COMMON  
TO THE MEMBER STATES . . .’: POTENTIAL IN THE  
VERBUND DIMENSION

8. Article 2 TEU as Constitutional Frame of the Verbund	165
I. Introduction	165
II. What Holds a Federal System Together?	165
A. Constitutional Homogeneity in Federal Systems	166
B. Constitutional Homogeneity in the Verbund	167
III. Article 2 TEU as a Framework for Constitutional Homogeneity Claims	171
A. Three Claims	172
B. Three Functions	176
IV. Guaranteeing Constitutional Homogeneity Through the EU Judicial System	180
9. Top-Down Review	183
I. Introduction	183
II. Countering Illiberal Developments in the Member States	183
A. Institutionally: Why the Court?	185
B. Substantively: What Legal Basis?	190
III. The Potential of Article 2 TEU	192
A. <i>ASJP</i> or How to Kill Two Birds with One Stone	194
B. Beyond <i>ASJP</i> : Operationalizing the Values of ‘Human Rights’ and ‘Democracy’	197

10. Horizontal Review	203
I. Introduction	203
II. Direct Review Through Infringement Actions	204
A. Involving Member States in Policing Value Compliance: The Shortcomings of Political Procedures	204
B. Peer Pressure Beyond Political Procedures: Article 259 TEU	206
III. Indirect Review Through Mutual Recognition Regimes	209
A. <i>Horizontal Solange</i>	210
1. Mutual recognition regimes: Gateways for rule of law and fundamental rights considerations	210
2. The far-reaching effects of <i>horizontal Solange</i>	213
B. Making Better Use of Mutual Recognition Regimes	215
1. Current shortcomings	215
2. Beyond the European Arrest Warrant: Increasing the stakes for non-compliant Member States	219
11. Bottom-Up Review	223
I. Introduction	223
II. Tapping the Potential of Constitutional Identity Reviews	223
A. Institutionally: Moving Towards a More Relational Approach	225
B. Substantively: Moving Away from Article 4(2) TEU	227
III. The Potential of Article 2 TEU	230
A. Formulating Identity as Common Value Concerns	230
1. Substantive level	230
2. Procedural level	234
B. What's In It for National Constitutional Courts?	236
PART IV RISKS AND RECALIBRATION	
12. Towards a Tyranny of EU Values?	243
I. Introduction	243
II. Jeopardizing the Rule of Law: Article 2 TEU as a Gateway for CJEU Judges' Politics, Morality, or Ideology?	244
A. Value Concretization	245
1. The indeterminacy objection	245
2. Rejoinders	247
B. Value Conflicts	251
1. The balancing objection	251
2. Rejoinders	252
III. Jeopardizing Democracy: Article 2 TEU as a Path to a European <i>Gouvernement des Juges?</i>	254
A. Diagonal Tensions	255
1. The counter-majoritarian objection	255
2. Rejoinders	256

B. Horizontal Tensions	259
1. The judicial overreach objection	259
2. Rejoinders	261
13. Disrupting the Federal Balance?	265
I. Introduction	265
II. Concerns for the Federal Balance	265
A. Competence and Identity	266
1. Article 5(1) TEU: the ultra-vires objection	266
2. Article 4(2) TEU: the identity objection	268
B. Pluralism and Diversity	270
1. Normative level: the constitutional pluralism objection	271
2. Factual level: the diversity objection	272
III. Limiting the Impact of Article 2 TEU in the Verbund Dimension	273
A. Limiting the Obligations in Article 2 TEU	274
1. Minimum obligations	275
2. Red lines, regression, and results	276
B. Limiting the Enforcement of Article 2 TEU	279
1. Limiting enforcement by the EU	279
2. Limiting enforcement by the Court of Justice	280
Conclusions	291
<i>Bibliography</i>	297
<i>Index</i>	351