

Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction	15
I. Subject matter	15
II. Central research question	20
III. State of research	23
1. The ambiguous binding effect as a reason for the low application rate	24
2. The limited number of guiding cases as a reason for the low application rate	26
3. Chinese legal education as a reason for the low application rate	28
4. The content of guiding cases as a reason for their low application rate	29
5. The quality of guiding cases as a reason for the low application rate	30
IV. Structure	32
V. Research methods	38
Chapter 2: The development of guiding cases in China	41
I. Introduction	41
II. State of research	43
1. Research on the cases issued by the SPC before 1985	43
2. Research on the typical cases in the SPC Gazette	44
a. Research on the objectives and content	44
b. Research on the structure	47
c. Research on the binding effect of guiding cases	49
3. Research on the objectives of the guiding cases system	51
III. Cases and policy	54

IV.	Typical cases in the Gazette of the Supreme People's Court	61
1.	The original objective of typical cases in the SPC Gazette	62
a.	Raising public awareness of trial work and the socialist legal system	62
b.	Providing guidance and reference to lower courts	64
2.	Selection of typical cases in the Gazette of the SPC	65
a.	Selection procedure	65
b.	Various types of typical cases	68
3.	The structure of typical cases in the SPC Gazette	71
a.	Abstract of adjudication	72
b.	Focus of dispute	76
4.	The impact of the SPC's Gazette typical cases	79
5.	The SPC Gazette's typical cases and guiding cases	81
V.	The establishment of the guiding cases system	83
1.	Experiments at the local level	83
a.	Experiment in Henan	87
b.	Experiment in Sichuan	93
aa.	Sichuan High People's Court	93
bb.	The Chengdu Intermediate People's Court	96
c.	Experiment in Tianjin	99
d.	Experiment in Zhejiang	101
e.	Evaluation of experimentation at the local level	103
aa.	Similarities of local experimentation	103
bb.	The SPC's attitude toward local courts' experimentation	104
2.	The SPC's guiding cases system	107
a.	The official establishment of the guiding cases system	107
b.	The regulations of the guiding cases system	113
c.	The SPC's objectives of establishing the guiding cases system	116
aa.	Limiting the discretion of judges	117
bb.	Replacing official replies and simple replies of the SPC	121
cc.	Introducing guiding cases in addition to typical cases	126
VI.	Similar-case searching system	127
1.	Development of the similar-case searching mechanism	128
2.	Practice of similar-case searching in local level courts	132

3. Combination of guiding cases and similar-case searching	134
VII. Summary	137
Chapter 3: The Binding Effect of Guiding Cases	141
I. Introduction	141
II. State of research	143
1. Research on the issue of legal binding effect and guiding cases	143
2. Research on the factual binding effect	144
3. Research on the reform proposals for guiding cases	148
a. Guiding cases as a new form of judicial interpretation	148
b. Replacing judicial interpretations with guiding cases	149
c. Guiding cases as a new legal source	150
III. The meaning of the term “shall refer to” in the Chinese legal context	152
1. “Refer to” in the context of the Administrative Litigation Law	152
2. “Shall refer to” in the context of the guiding cases system	154
a. “Shall refer to” and “can refer to”	156
b. “Shall refer to” and factual binding effect	157
c. The implementation of the factual binding effect	160
aa. Performance management and supervision by higher courts	160
bb. Full consideration of guiding cases	165
cc. Factual binding effect in the sense of the German legal system	170
d. Ambiguous binding effect and low application rate	174
3. Why guiding cases are not granted legal binding effect	175
a. The binding effect of guiding cases and China’s constitutional system	176
b. Legal binding effect of judicial interpretations	179
c. Guiding cases system based on self-empowerment of the SPC	187
aa. The SPC as the highest authority in the court system	187
bb. Legal basis for the guiding cases system according to the SPC	189
cc. Lack of authorization from the legislator	191

d. Strategic adjustments of the SPC	197
4. Factual binding effect and key points of adjudication	200
a. Key points of adjudication	201
b. Scope of the factual binding effect of guiding cases	203
c. Key points of adjudication and application of guiding cases	206
IV. Summary	210
Chapter 4: The Procedure of Guiding-Case Selection	213
I. Introduction	213
II. State of research	215
1. Research on the selection procedure	215
2. Research on the editing of guiding cases	217
3. Research on the efficiency of the selection procedure	219
III. Overall selection procedure according to SPC documents	220
IV. Selection procedure of guiding cases	224
1. SPC Research Office	224
2. Case Guidance Office	226
3. Trial divisions of the SPC	229
4. Temporary procedure of the guiding cases system	232
5. SPC circuit courts	233
6. SPC adjudication committee	234
V. Recommendations from local levels	235
1. Unbalanced contribution to guiding case applications	235
2. High courts	237
3. Intermediate and basic courts	239
4. Search and preparation work relating to potential guiding cases	241
5. Directive cases of high courts	247
a. Application of directive cases	249
b. Publication of directive cases	253
c. Structure of directive cases	257
d. Trial work documents of high courts	261
e. Limited capacity of research offices at local levels	265

VI. Editing work of guiding cases	269
1. Keywords	270
2. Basic facts	271
3. Reasoning part	275
VII. Evaluation and rewards	278
1. Evaluation	279
2. Rewards	282
VIII. Summary	284
Chapter 5: Substantive criteria for the selection of guiding cases	289
I. Introduction	289
II. State of research	290
1. Research on the substantial standards of guiding cases	290
2. Research on the classification of guiding cases	291
III. General standards for the selection of guiding cases	295
1. Positive social effect	296
2. Avoiding controversial issues	298
3. Typicality and representativeness	301
IV. Different types of guiding cases	303
1. Cases repeating the content of law or judicial interpretations	305
a. Cases applying new law	305
b. Cases responding to public concerns	310
2. Cases correcting mistakes in applying the law	316
3. Cases that change the law	318
4. Cases supplementing the law	322
a. Providing definitions of legal concepts	324
b. Applying analogy and extensive interpretation	327
c. Filling legal loopholes	329
d. Providing evidence rules	334
V. Summary	336
Chapter 6: Application of Guiding Cases in Practice	339
I. Introduction	339

II. State of research	341
1. Research on the general statistics	341
2. Research on judges' guiding-case applications	342
3. Research on parties' references to guiding cases	345
4. Research on the comparison points	346
5. Research on guiding cases and administrative organs	349
III. Application of guiding cases by judges	349
1. Active application	349
2. Judges' preference for implicit application	350
3. Pragmatic application of cases	353
4. Insufficient research and practice relating to applying cases in trials	357
a. Judges' training	358
b. Legal education in colleges and universities	359
IV. Strong motivation of parties to cite guiding cases	360
1. In pursuit of interests by parties	360
2. Guiding cases proposed by parties without response from judges	362
V. Citation of guiding cases in judicial practice	364
1. Key points of adjudication	366
2. Guiding cases as arguments	368
3. Citation of the reasoning part in guiding cases	370
4. Flexible application of guiding cases	371
VI. Rejection of guiding cases in court practice	375
1. Difference in facts	379
2. Difference in law application	380
3. Insufficient proof	384
VII. Influence of guiding cases on administrative organs	385
1. Influence on regulations	385
a. Influence on administrative regulation	385
b. Influence on local government rules	386
2. Influence on administrative organs in practice	389
a. Influence on administrative organs in judicial practice	389
b. Limited influence on administrative organs in executive practice	390

VIII. Summary	393
Chapter 7: Conclusion	397
Appendix	411
List of References	427