Contents



Acknowledgements	page xı
Table of Cases	xiii
Introduction	1
1 Defining Art	10
1.1 Defining Art in Theory of Art	11
1.1.1 Classical Approaches to Art	12
1.1.1.1 Does Art Mean Making Beautiful Things?	12
1.1.1.2 Does Art Mean Imitating Reality?	13
1.1.2 Modern Theories of Art	14
1.1.2.1 Modern Artistic Practice and Its Influence	
on Modern Artistic Theories	15
1.1.2.2 Art as an Open Concept	17
1.1.2.3 Danto and the Institutional Theory of the Arts	18
1.1.3 Contemporary Art Theories	20
1.2 Defining Art in Law	22
1.2.1 Why the Law Should Not Provide a Definition of	
the Arts	22
1.2.2 The Law Does Not Offer a Definition of the Arts	2 4
1.2.2.1 Non-definition of the Arts under Cultural	
Heritage Law	24
1.2.2.2 Non-definition of the Arts under Intellectual	•
Property Law	26
1.2.3 Challenges Arising from the Problem of Non-definition	1
of the Concept of 'Art'	27
1.2.3.1 Exceptions to Rules of General Application	28
1.2.3.2 Classification of Artists and Artworks	29
	-9

	1.2.3.3 Legitimate Limitations or Negation of the	
	Qualification of Art?	33
	Concluding Remarks	36
2	The Nature, Scope and Protection of Artistic Freedom	38
	2.1 The Emergence of a Distinct Right to Artistic Freedom	40
	2.1.1 Issues of Terminology: Creation, Expression or	
	Entertainment?	40
	2.1.2 The Input of Constitutional Traditions	42
	2.1.2.1 The Legacy of the Weimar Constitution	42
	2.1.2.2 The Legacy of the French Genre of Caricature	44
	2.2 The Nature of Artistic Freedom	47
	2.2.1 The Free Enjoyment of the Arts in Light of Article 27 of the UDHR	48
	2.2.2 The Free Speech Approach to Artistic Freedom	49
	2.2.3 Cultural and Collective Aspects of Artistic Freedom	51
	2.3 The Scope and Institutional Protection of Artistic Freedom	53
	2.3.1 The Protection of Artistic Freedom by UNESCO	53
	2.3.2 The Practice of International Human Rights Bodies	56
	2.3.2.1 The Practice of the UN Human	
	Rights Committee	56
	2.3.2.2 The Practice of the Committee on	
	Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	57
	2.3.3 The Practice of Regional Human Rights Bodies	59
	2.3.3.1 Artistic Freedom in the Context of the	
ş.	European System	59
	2.3.3.2 Artistic Freedom in the Context of the Inter-	
	American System -	62
	2.3.3.3 Artistic Freedom in the Context of the	
	African System	64
	Concluding Remarks	66
3	Censorship and Restrictions	68
	3.1 Arts Should Be Free: Abstaining from Censorship in the Arts	70
	3.1.1 Legitimate or Illegitimate Censorship?	70
	3.1.1.1 Lack of Clarity in International Standards	71
	3.1.1.2 The Hate Speech Exception	76
	3.1.1.3 Negationism, Revisionism and	^
	Holocaust Denial	80

nte	

3.1.2 Challenging Prior Restraints before Human	
Rights Bodies	82
3.1.2.1 An Obligation of Most Careful Scrutiny	83
3.1.2.2 Challenging Classification for Theatre,	
Video Art and Cinematography	85
3.1.2.3 Challenging Censorship in Painting and the	
Visual Arts	87
3.2 Minimal Restrictions in the Exercise of Artistic Freedom	89
3.2.1 Subsequent Imposition of Liability	89
3.2.2 Balancing Conflicting Interests at the ECtHR	90
3.2.2.1 Effectively Protecting the Arts	90
3.2.2.2 Restrictions or Duties and Responsibilities?	92
3.2.3 Preventing Private Actors from Interfering?	93
3.2.3.1 Private Exhibitions and Events	93
3.2.3.2 Digital Art and Social Media	96
Concluding Remarks	97
Positive Obligations in Relation to Artistic Freedom	00
4.1 Providing Effective Judicial Remedies	99 101
4.1.1 Effective Remedies against Censorship in Performan	
Art and Music	101
4.1.2 Reparations for Demolition of Art Installations	103
4.2 Positive Obligations under the ICESCR	103
4.2.1 Obligations Relevant to Participation in Cultural Life	_
4.2.1.1 Artistic Freedom and Participation in	, , , ,
Cultural Life	104
4.2.1.2 Shaping Collective Cultural Representations	•
4.2.2 Positive Obligations Relevant to Artistic Freedom	
and Practice	107
4.2.2.1 Take Steps by All Appropriate Means	107
4.2.2.2 To the Maximum of Its Available Resources	
4.2.2.3 Achieving Progressively	111
4.2.3 The Application of the 4-A Scheme in	
Artistic Freedom	111
4.3 Non-discrimination and Equality Obligations in the	
Art Worlds	115
4-3.1 Towards the Elimination of Discriminatory Practice	
against Artists and Creatives	115
4.3.1.1 Towards Elimination of Direct Discrimination	n 115

viii Contents

	4.3.1.2 Towards Elimination of	
	Indirect Discrimination	118
	4.3.1.3 Eliminating Discrimination in the Digital	
	Art World	119
	4.3.2 Real Equality in the Art World	121
	4.3.2.1 Is Real Equality Ever Possible?	121
	4.3.2.2 Affirmative Action and Artistic Freedom	122
	Concluding Remarks	126
5	Street Art, Graffiti and Art in Public Space	128
	5.1 The Human Rights Law Perspective on Graffiti and	
	Street Art	130
	5.1.1 Definitions of Graffiti and Street Art	130
	5.1.1.1 Terminology Issues	130
	5.1.1.2 Transgressive or Mainstream?	131
	5.1.2 Graffiti as a Grey Area in Law	135
	5.1.2.1 Legal Treatment in Domestic Laws	135
٠,	5.1.2.2 State Obligations under Human Rights Law	136
	5.1.2.3 Arguments against Removal from the	
	Public Space	138
	5.1.3 Street Art for Future Generations?	141
	5.1.3.1 Murals and the Preservation of	
	Cultural Identities	141
	5.1.3.2 Murals as Urban Cultural Heritage	144
	5.2 Artistic Freedom, Cultural Heritage and Urban Planning	146
	5.2.1 Is Contemporary Street Art Cultural Heritage?	146
	5.2.1.1 La Demeure du Chaos (Abode of Chaos)	146
	5.2.1.2 The Legacy of 5Pointz	149
	5.2.2 Unpopular Art and the Urban Space	152
	5.2.2.1 A Human Rights Law Perspective to	
	Richard Serra's Tilted Arc	152
	5.2.2.2 Debates on Racist and Sexist Art in the	
	Public Space	155
	Concluding Remarks	157
6	Public Morality, Obscenity and the Arts	159
	6.1 Evil, Worthless and Immoral Arts	161
	6.1.1 The Contextuality of Morality Considerations	161
	6.1.1.1 Is There a Universal Standard of Morality?	1 61
	6112 Obscenity Treaties and Lack of Agreement	16-

Contents ix

6.1.2 The Applicable Legal Framework	165
6.1.2.1 UNESCO, Plato and Human Rights Law	165
6.1.2.2 Who Is the Average Person?	166
6.1.3 Artistic Value as an Oxymoron	169
6.1.3.1 To Pronounce or Not to Pronounce on	
Artistic Value?	169
6.1.3.2 Art Value for Funding	172
6.2 Obscenity, Artistic Defences and the Human Body	174
6.2.1 Defences against Obscenity for Fine Arts	
and Performance	174
6.2.1.1 Painting, Sculpture and the Artistic Genre of Nude	175
6.2.1.2 Bodily Harm in Performance Art	176
6.2.2 Human Dignity and Cadaver Art	178
6.2.2.1 The Exhibition Body Worlds (Korpewelte)	178
6.2.2.2 Human Rights Concerns in Relation to Cadaver	
Art design of the second of th	180
6.2.3 Paedophilia and Child Pornography as a Hard Case	182
6.2.3.1 The Problem of Child Pornography in Fine Arts	
and Photography	182
6.2.3.2 Japanese Manga and Lolicons	185
6.2.3.3 Raising Awareness about Child Pornography	187
Concluding Remarks	188
Blasphemous Paintings, Cartoons and Other Religiously	
Offensive Art	190
7.1 Local and Global Controversies	193
7.1.1 A Divide between Religious and Secular States?	193
7.1.1.1 The Decline of Purely Religious Arts	193
7.1.1.2 Persistence of Religious Offences	194
7.1.1.3 The Unique Approach of the US Supreme	
Court to Religious Offences	198
7.1.2 The Rise of Globalized Cultural Conflicts	200
7.1.2.1 Blasphemous Arts and Cartoons across	
Religious Traditions	200
7.1.2.2 What Does the Sharia Actually Say?	204
7.2 The Approach of Human Rights Bodies	208
7.2.1 Key Elements of Religious Offences in the Arts	208
7.2.1.1 What Are Intentional Offences?	208
7212 The Impact of the Work	

	7.2.2	When	re Would	UN	Human	Ri
		tha I	ino2			

ights Bodies Draw the Line:

7.2.3 Where Would the European Court Draw the Line? Concluding Remarks

Index 221

211

213

217