

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abbreviations	13
Preface	15
Introduction	19
Introduction to reading: a dynamic view of the sources	22
Methodologies and structure	25

Part I BACKGROUND AND FOREGROUND TO THE VICTORINES

Chapter one: The Patristic heritage	31
I. Five Augustinian themes	31
1. Image and likeness	31
2. Restoration of the image	33
3. Framing prophecy and extasis: three "visions"	34
4. Augustine's model for <i>extasis</i>	36
a. The Ecstasy of Milan (<i>Conf.</i> VII, x, 16)	37
b. <i>Extasis</i> and rejection	39
c. Another <i>extasis</i> : Ostia (<i>Conf.</i> IX, x, 24–25)	41
d. <i>Extasis</i> and representations	44
e. Pragmatic consequences	46
5. <i>Corpus quod aggravat animam</i>	48
II. Gregory the Great	51
1. Contemplation: seeing the light and seeing images	52
2. Love as cognition?	57
Chapter II: Twelfth-century problems	59
I. Describing cognition	61
II. Disparity between epistemology and theological anthropology	65

Part II VICTORINE THEOLOGICAL ANTHROPOLOGY IN THE TWELFTH CENTURY

Chapter one: Hugh of Saint-Victor	73
I. Selected and edited influences	76
1. Augustine revised	77
a. Image and likeness	78

b. <i>Speculum</i> and <i>specula</i> : mirror imagery revised	81
c. Presence and absence of God	88
2. Gregory the Great revised	90
3. Areopagitic elements	92
a. Reinventing <i>theophania</i>	93
b. A theology of wisdom and light	95
c. The created world: theophany, <i>materialis manuductio</i> and sign	97
d. <i>Symbolum</i> and <i>anagoge</i>	98
II. The doctrinal framework of Hugh	100
1. Descriptions of the original condition	101
2. Narratives of the Fall	104
3. Descriptions of the present state	108
4. Descriptions of the future: eschatology	110
5. Epistemology: disparate models for the cognition of God	113
III. Contemplation in contexts: from eschatology to ecstasy	115
1. Contemplation in the prelapsarian and the final states	115
2. Contemplation in this life	117
a. Contemplation as mental activity	117
b. Contemplation and restoration of the image	118
c. <i>Spiritus Dei</i> and <i>oculus contemplationis</i> : Hugh's doctrine on contemplative ecstasy	119
IV. Hidden things in God, the limits of cognition and Seraphic love	125
1. Cognition and love	125
2. The unknowable in God	128
3. Angels circling. The development of a "mystical" theme	130
4. A historical note on the superiority of Seraphim over Cherubim	135
Conclusion	138
Chapter II: Richard of Saint-Victor	143
Introduction	143
1. Richard as "mystic:" trends of the literature	144
2. The plan of investigation	152
3. Systematic presentations of contemplation: six kinds and three modes	153
4. Preliminary remarks on Richard's spiritual prose	157
I. Background to contemplation	162
1. The doctrinal context: the primordial and the final states	163
2. Epistemological and anthropological background	167
a. Two models?	169
b. Hindrances to contemplation	172

3. Perception and expression: the creative aspects of <i>similitudo</i>	173
a. Naphtali	174
b. The grades of the third contemplation	177
c. Abraham at Mambre	178
II. Contemplation: five investigations	181
1. <i>Contemplatio</i> and <i>speculatio</i>	181
2. Contemplation as dynamic process	189
a. The general scheme	190
b. Entering ecstasy: analyses of the moment	192
c. The epistemological narrative	195
d. The theological narratives	197
3. Paul's rapture: the paradigm of ecstatic contemplation	203
a. Variations on three heavens and rapture	204
b. Consequences of the tropological reading	209
4. Attitudes towards contemplation	212
5. The "affective" interpretation of ecstasy	218
III. Contemplation as face-to-face vision?	227
1. Four discussed passages	232
a. <i>Adnotatio in Ps 2</i> : three heavens	232
b. <i>Benjamin major</i> IV, vii: angels face to face	234
c. <i>Benjamin major</i> IV, xi: Abraham at Mambre	235
d. <i>Adnotatio in Ps 113</i> : an example of self-reflective interpretation	236
2. Seeing face to face	239
Conclusion	242
Chapter III: Achard and Walter of Saint-Victor	247
I. Achard of St Victor	248
1. The image and the prelapsarian state	249
2. Contemplation	250
II. Walter of Saint-Victor	256
1. The image, the prelapsarian state, and the Fall	256
2. Restoration	258
a. The ascent of Christ as prefiguration	259
b. Paul's rapture	260
c. Seeing through faith, by contemplation, and face to face	262
Conclusion	263
Chapter IV: The question of a twelfth-century Victorine spirituality	265
I. Victorines: a doctrinal community?	266
II. Contemplation and community	271
III. Conclusion: The Victorine model	274

Chapter V: The prelapsarian cognition of God outside the Saint-Victor (c. 1140-c. 1200)	277
I. Adaptations: the <i>Summa sententiarum</i> and the <i>Sentences</i> of the Lombard	278
1. The <i>Summa sententiarum</i> of Odo of Lucca	278
2. The <i>Sentences</i> of Peter Lombard	281
II. Interpretations: the prelapsarian Adam in the schools of Paris	288
1. A transitional Adam of the 1160s: the school of the Notre-Dame	289
2. Shifting focus: descendants of the <i>Ps.-Poitiers Gloss</i> and the <i>Stephen Langton Gloss</i>	296
Conclusion	301

Part III

REJECTION, TRANSFORMATION, OBLIVION: THE THIRTEENTH-CENTURY RECEPTION OF THE VICTORINE THEOLOGICAL ANTHROPOLOGY

Preliminary remarks: the thirteenth-century milieu	307
The "decline" of Saint-Victor	307
School theology and university (scholastic) theology	309
<i>Speculum et aenigma</i> : the reinterpretation of 1Cor 13:12	313
A doctrinal decision: knowing God <i>per essentiam</i>	315
Chapter one: Paul's rapture and the <i>visio mediastina</i>	323
Introduction	323
I. Peter Lombard's <i>Collectanea</i> and its limits	327
II. The emergence of the <i>visio mediastina</i> (c. 1160 to c. 1215). Five witnesses	330
1. The <i>Ps-Poitiers Gloss</i>	332
2. Peter the Chanter, <i>Postilla super 2Cor</i>	332
3. Magister Martinus, <i>Summa</i>	334
4. Stephen Langton, <i>Quaestiones</i> and <i>Postilla super 2Cor</i>	335
5. Simon of Tournai, <i>Disputationes</i>	338
III. The creation of <i>raptus</i> and the elimination of <i>visio mediastina</i> (the 1210s to the 1230s)	340
1. The making of <i>raptus</i> (c. 1215 to c. 1230s)	341
2. The dilution of <i>visio mediastina</i> (the 1210s to the 1230s). Five witnesses	343
a. Godfrey of Poitiers, <i>Summa</i>	344
b. <i>Visio mediastina</i> in Ms Douai, BM 434 (c. 1225-1237)	345

c. William of Auxerre, <i>Summa aurea</i>	348
d. Roland of Cremona OP, <i>Summa</i>	349
e. Gueric of Saint-Quentin OP, <i>Postilla in 2 Cor</i>	350
3. Consequences of the development	352
Conclusion	355
Chapter II: The prelapsarian cognition in the thirteenth-century university theology	359
Introduction: the limits of interpretation	359
I. Glosses on the <i>Sentences</i>	364
1. The <i>Glossa</i> of Alexander of Hales	364
2. The <i>Glossa</i> of Hugh of Saint-Cher OP	366
3. The <i>Glossa</i> of Jean de la Rochelle OFM	367
4. Lost interpretations of the early 1240s: Mss Paris, BNF, lat. 15652 and lat. 15702	367
II. The first commentaries on the <i>Sentences</i>	369
1. Oxford: Richard Fishacre OP	371
2. Oxford: Richard Rufus OFM, <i>Lectura Oxoniensis</i>	376
3. Paris: Odo Rigaldi OFM	381
4. Paris: Albert the Great OP	384
III. The <i>Summa Halensis</i>	386
1. <i>Quaestio</i> : means of research or format of teaching?	388
2. The solution of the <i>Summa Halensis</i>	389
3. Sets of arguments	391
4. Heterodox positions and the last connoisseurs of Hugh	393
IV. After the <i>Summa Halensis</i> : a dozen variants of the same	398
Conclusion	414
Chapter III: Reinterpretations of the Victorine theological anthropology in the spiritual literature of the thirteenth century	421
Introduction: Reading Victorine works in a new context	421
I. Thomas Gallus	427
1. Thomas Gallus, "mystical" theologian	429
2. Thomas on prelapsarian cognition	438
3. Thomas reading Victorine sources	440
Conclusion	446
II. Digression: Franciscan adaptations of Victorine concepts and phrases in non-spiritual works	448

III. Saint Bonaventure	452
1. Rewriting Hugh: the anthropological matrix of Bonaventure	453
2. The <i>Itinerarium</i>	460
3. Triggering ecstasy?	464
Conclusion	466
IV. Thomas Aquinas	466
V. Hugh of Balma	470
VI. Rudolph of Biberach	475
Conclusion	482
The Victorine theological anthropology and its decline: conclusion and summary	487
APPENDICES	
Appendix 1: Hugh of Saint-Victor, <i>De sacramentis</i> : revised passages	503
1. <i>De sacramentis</i> I, vi, 14	504
2. <i>De sacramentis</i> I, ix, 3	505
Appendix 2: The reception of the Odonian-Lombardian Adam: a dozen marginal witnesses (c. 1145-c. 1245)	507
1. Compiling from the <i>Summa sententiarum</i> : the <i>Sententiae divinitatis</i> and the <i>Sententiae Sidonis</i>	508
2. Compiling from the <i>Sentences</i> of Peter Lombard: eleven witnesses	509
Appendix 3: Anonymous glosses on the <i>Sentences</i>	514
Appendix 4: Richard Fishacre, Richard Rufus and Odo Rigaldi on the prelapsarian cognition	516
Richard Fishacre, <i>In II Sent.</i> dist. 23 and <i>In IV Sent.</i> dist. 1	516
<i>In II Sent.</i> dist. 23	516
<i>In IV Sent.</i> dist. 1, c. 3	518
Parallel texts: Richard Fishacre and Richard Rufus on <i>Sent. II</i> dist. 23	519
Richard Rufus, <i>Lectura Oxoniensis</i> , <i>In II Sent.</i> dist. 23 D, E; <i>In II Sent.</i> dist. 5 B	523
Odo Rigaldi, <i>In II Sent.</i> dist. 23	530
Sources and Bibliography	539
A. Manuscripts	539
Works by anonymous / unidentified authors	539
Works of identified authors	540

B. Printed sources	541
Victorine Sources	541
Translations	543
Other sources	543
C. Literature	549
Index	
Manuscripts	565
Scriptural references	566
Index of names	568
Victorine sources	572
Patristic and medieval writings	576
Thematic and subject index	581