Contents

Foreword ... XI

Main abbreviations ... XII

1 Introduction ... 1

1.1 On the non-linearity of (legal) thought ... 1
1.2 Invalid appointments, fugitive slaves and heretical prelates (or, on the content of this book) ... 5
1.3 A few methodological remarks ... 10

Part I: From Accursius to Bartolus (via France)

2 The Accursian Gloss ... 17

2.1 The *lex Barbarius* ... 19
2.2 Barbarius' praetorship ... 23
2.3 Putative freedom and the validity of the acts ... 31
2.4 The problem of presumed will ... 40
2.5 Applications of Barbarius' case ... 49
2.6 Putative notary? ... 52

3 Postglossators and Common Mistake: a tale of Odofredus, Jacobus de Arena and Butrigarius ... 61

3.1 Variations on the Gloss: Odofredus de Denaris ... 62
3.2 The dissent of Jacobus de Arena ... 72
3.3 Butrigarius and the Accursian Orthodoxy ... 81

4 *Ultramontani* & Co. ... 89

4.1 Jean de Monchy ... 91
4.2 Jacques de Révigny ... 93
4.3 Martinus Syllimani ... 106
4.4 Pierre de Belleperche ... 111
4.5 Cynus da Pistoia ... 125
4.6 Guido da Suzzara ... 133
4.7 Guillaume de Cunh ... 140
4.8 On the risk of being quoted by Cynus ... 156

5 A fragile synthesis: Bartolus de Saxoferrato ... 161

5.1 A strategic defence of the Gloss ... 161
5.2 Legal ecumenism ... 168

5.3 Ambiguous notaries ... 172
5.4 Bartolus *ultramontanus?* ... 177

Part II: Canon law and the development of the concept of toleration

6 From Gratian's *Decretum* to its Gloss ... 189

6.1 Sacramental and jurisdictional powers ... 191
6.2 Toleration in the *Decretum* ... 196
6.3 The decretists and the concept of toleration ... 200
6.3.1 From Rolandus to Huguccio ... 200
6.3.2 The excommunication by the secret excommunicate ... 211
6.4 Johannes Teutonicus and the Ordinary Gloss on the *Decretum* 228

7 Innocent IV and toleration ... 241

7.1 Confirmation and toleration ... 241
7.2 Toleration and representation ... 244
7.3 Scope of toleration ... 246
7.4 Some specific applications ... 254
7.5 Toleration, common mistake and public utility ... 260
7.6 Innocent IV and the *lex Barbarius* ... 277

8 Toleration in the aftermath of Innocent IV ... 283

8.1 Parmensis and the Gloss on the *Liber Extra* ... 283
8.2 Hostiensis ... 287
8.3 Guido de Baysio ... 291
8.4 The *Speculum Iudiciale* ... 295
8.5 Johannes Andreae ... 303

Part III: Baldus de Ubaldis and the limits of representation

9 Toleration without representation: Albericus de Rosate ... 317

10 Baldus' writings on the *lex Barbarius* ... 333

10.1 Two authors for one *repetitio* ... 333
10.2 *Lectura, repetitio, additio* ... 339

11 The anatomy of representation ... 345

11.1 *Dignitas*: worthiness and aptitude ... 348
11.2 Office and incumbent ... 352
11.3 Collegiate bodies and possessory issues ... 361
11.4 Incumbent vs. office ... 365

11.5 Confirmation in office ... 370
11.6 Toleration and representation ... 375
11.7 Toleration and sacramental issues ... 393

12 Baldus and the *lex Barbarius* ... 397

12.1 A different perspective ... 397
12.2 Barbarius and the problem of toleration ... 401
12.3 Common mistake and public utility ... 417
12.4 From Innocent to Barbarius: Baldus' three-step approach ... 424
12.4.1 Voidable election ... 426
12.4.2 Possession of ordinary jurisdiction ... 431
12.4.3 Public utility and representation: internal vs. external validity ... 445

13 Extensions of the *lex Barbarius* to other cases (or vice versa) ... 463

13.1 Judges and prelates ... 463
13.2 Notaries ... 470

Part IV: *Barbarius post Baldum*

14 From the *lex Barbarius* to the brocard *error communis ius facit* ... 489

14.1 Late commentators and early simplifications ... 489
14.1.1 Angelus de Ubaldis ... 489
14.1.2 Raphael de Fulgosiis ... 492
14.1.3 Paulus de Castro ... 495
14.1.4 Jason de Mayno ... 498
14.1.5 Felinus Sandeus, delegate judges and public utility ... 501
14.2 Early modern times ... 504
14.2.1 Simplifying the simplification ... 504
14.2.2 The *fonctionnaire de fait* ... 512
14.3 Toleration in late medieval and early modern canon law ... 514
14.3.1 Toleration and sacraments ... 514
14.3.2 Coloured title ... 521
14.4 Bellapertica the American (or, a hint at the common law side of things) ... 524

Conclusion ... 529

Appendix ... 535
Bibliography ... 539
Index ... 581