

# Contents

Preface .....	xi
Abbreviations .....	xv

## Introduction

0.1. Divided Scholarship .....	xix
0.2. Tisserant and Hambye .....	xxiii
0.3. Will East and West Meet? .....	xxviii
0.4. Conclusion .....	xxxix

## Part I

### Survey of Recent Literature

1.1. In English .....	3
1.2. In German .....	9
1.3. In French .....	15
1.4. In Italian .....	18
1.5. In Spanish and Portuguese .....	21
1.6. In Other Western Languages .....	23
1.7. In Malayalam and Tamil .....	25
1.8. Analysis of the Survey .....	26
1.9. Conclusion .....	27

## Part II

### Methodological Prolegomena

2.1. Terminology .....	34
2.2. Historicism .....	40
2.2.1. The Drama of Historicism .....	41
2.2.2. A Case Study in Historicism .....	43
2.3. The Historical Method .....	45
2.4. Models for the Quest of the Historical Thomas .....	48
2.5. Applying Historical Criticism .....	52
2.6. <i>Traditionskritik</i> .....	54
2.7. Conclusion .....	57

**Part III**  
**Nine Theories**

3.1.	India Confused with Other Countries like Ethiopia .....	63
3.1.1.	Ancient Geography .....	63
3.1.2.	Ethiopia and India Confused? .....	65
3.1.3.	India Qualified .....	68
3.1.4.	Relations Between the West and India .....	71
3.1.5.	The Fathers of the Church and India .....	75
3.1.6.	Modern Times .....	79
3.2.	The <i>Acts of Thomas</i> Is No Historical Source .....	81
3.2.1.	The Apocrypha .....	81
3.2.2.	The <i>Acts of Thomas</i> .....	85
3.2.3.	The Literary Genre of the <i>Acts of Thomas</i> .....	89
3.2.4.	The Five Major Apocryphal <i>Acts of the Apostles</i> . A Comparison .....	91
3.2.5.	The <i>Acts of Thomas</i> as Fiction or History? .....	93
3.3.	Apostolic Foundation in India an Edessan Invention .....	97
3.3.1.	Edessa Not of Apostolic Origin .....	97
3.3.2.	Inventing Apostolic Origin in India? .....	100
3.4.	No Christianity in India in the Second Century .....	107
3.4.1.	The Tradition Reported by Origen .....	107
3.4.2.	Commentary .....	108
3.4.3.	Bardaisan's Silence .....	111
3.5.	Parthia and India as Alternatives .....	113
3.5.1.	Parthia/India .....	114
3.5.2.	Gundaphar, King of Indo-Parthia .....	117
3.6.	Apostle Bartholomew India's Apostle .....	119
3.6.1.	The Visit of Pantaenus to India .....	120
3.6.2.	Interpretations of Pantaenus's Visit .....	124
3.6.3.	Bartholomew the Second Apostle of India? .....	130
3.7.	Not Apostle Thomas but Thomas of Kinai (Cana) .....	137
3.7.1.	Thomas of Kinai ( <i>Knāyi-Thomman</i> ) .....	139
3.7.2.	Northists and Southists .....	140
3.7.3.	The Southist Disclaimer .....	143

3.8.	Christian Origins in India from “Nestorian” Missions .....	145
3.8.1.	The Church in India Linked to the Church in Persia ...	146
3.8.2.	Dependence of Indian Christianity on the Persian Church .....	148
3.8.3.	Archaeological Evidence: “Pre-Nestorian” Crosses .....	153
3.9.	The Calamina Riddle .....	157
3.9.1.	The Problem .....	158
3.9.2.	Proposed Solutions .....	158
3.9.3.	Written Sources of “Calamina” .....	160
3.9.4.	The Historical Context .....	161
3.9.5.	Sociology and the Mental Horizon .....	164
3.9.6.	Philological Considerations .....	165
3.9.7.	Peculiar Dravidian Phonemes .....	168
3.9.8.	Critique of Proposed Solutions .....	171

**Part IV**  
**Patristic Texts on St. Thomas’s**  
**Field of Apostolate**

4.0.	Sharing the World Mission Among the Apostles .....	178
4.1.	Patristic Texts .....	181
	0. Pantaenus	1. Origen
	2. <i>Acts of Thomas</i>	3. <i>Clementine Recognitions</i>
	4. <i>The Doctrine of the Apostles</i>	5. Eusebius
	6. Ephrem	7. Gregory Nazianzen
	8. Cyrillona	9. Ambrose
	10. Chrysostom	11. Gaudentius
	12. Rufinus	13. Jerome
	14. Asterius	15. Paulinus of Nola
	16. Socrates Scholasticus	17. Jacob of Serugh
	18. Gregory of Tours	19. Gregory the Great
	20. Isidore of Seville	21. Pseudo-Dorotheus
	22. Codex of Fulda	23. Nicetas of Paphlagonia
	24. Oderic Vitalis	25. Dionysius bar Salibi
	26. Michael the Syrian Patriarch of Antioch	27. Mar Solomon of Basora
	28. Bar Hebraeus	29. Nicephorus Callistus Xanthopoulos
	30. Other Patristic Writers	31. Anonymous Texts.
4.2.	Threefold Division of the Patristic Texts .....	213

4.2.1.	Parthia Only .....	213
4.2.2.	India Only .....	214
4.2.3.	Parthia and India and Other Nations .....	215
4.3.	Apostle Thomas and Greater India .....	219
4.4.	Apostle of Many Nations .....	223
4.4.1.	Parthians .....	223
4.4.2.	Medes .....	223
4.4.3.	Persians .....	224
4.4.4.	Carmans .....	224
4.4.5.	Hyrceanians .....	224
4.4.6.	Bactrians .....	224
4.4.7.	Magians .....	224
4.4.8.	Indians .....	224
4.5.	The Source of the Edessan Relics .....	227
4.6.	The Fathers of the Church and the <i>Acts of Thomas</i> .....	233
4.6.1.	The Fathers and the Apocrypha .....	234
4.6.2.	Patristic Censure of the <i>Acts of Thomas</i> .....	238
4.6.3.	Patristic Witness Based on the Apostolic Tradition .....	241
4.6.4.	Texts and Cult .....	244
4.7.	Itinerary of the Apostle Thomas .....	247
	Synthesis and Conclusion .....	252

## Part V

### The Indian Tradition

5.0.	<i>Tradition and History in India</i> .....	258
5.0.1.	Historiography in India .....	258
5.0.2.	Historiography in India Today .....	263
5.0.3.	The Indian Traditions About the Apostle Thomas .....	266
5.1.	The North-west Indian Tradition .....	271
5.1.1.	Taxila of Gundaphar .....	271
5.1.2.	St. Thomas, the Apostle of Taxila .....	274
5.1.3.	Other North-west Indian Traditions .....	277
5.2.	The Inscription in Central India .....	281

5.2.1.	The Historical Setting .....	282
5.2.2.	The Text of the Inscription .....	285
5.2.3.	Observations on the Inscription .....	290
5.2.3.1.	Historical Background .....	290
5.2.3.2.	Udayesvara Temple .....	292
5.2.3.3.	The Text of the Inscription .....	293
5.2.3.4.	Initial Invocation .....	294
5.2.3.5.	Liturgy .....	294
5.2.3.6.	Theology .....	295
5.2.3.7.	Ecclesiology .....	296
5.2.3.8.	Architecture and Art .....	297
5.2.3.9.	Christian Communities in Medieval India .....	298
5.2.4.	Indian Scholars on the Inscription .....	299
5.2.5.	Final Observations .....	303
5.3.	The South Indian Tradition (1): The Tomb of Mylapore .....	305
5.3.1.	A Tomb With No Rival .....	305
5.3.2.	Archaeological Evidence .....	308
5.3.3.	The Mylapore Tomb a Forgery? .....	312
5.3.4.	The Name Mylapore .....	313
5.4.	The South Indian Tradition (2): The Apostle's Death: .....	321
5.4.1.	The Place of Death .....	321
5.4.2.	The Date .....	327
5.4.3.	The Manner .....	330
5.4.4.	A Study in Contrast: A Forged Tomb .....	331
5.5.	The South Indian Tradition (3): Palayur .....	335
5.5.1.	The Palayur Story .....	336
5.5.2.	Understanding the Palayur Story .....	338
5.5.3.	Hindu-Christian Tradition at Palayur .....	339
5.6.	The South Indian Tradition (4) : The Seven Churches .....	343
5.6.1.	The Seven Churches of Apostolic Foundation .....	343
5.6.2.	The Most Ancient Churches .....	353
5.6.3.	The New-World Gaff .....	354
5.7.	The South Indian Tradition (5) The Ballads .....	355
5.7.1.	<i>Veerāḍian</i> Songs .....	357
5.7.2.	<i>Mārgam-kali-pāttu</i> .....	357
5.7.3.	<i>Rambānpāttu</i> .....	358
5.7.3.1.	Textual Criticism .....	359

5.7.3.2. Contents .....	361
5.7.3.3. Historical Assessment .....	362
5.8. The South Indian Tradition (6): The Names Thomaschristians and Nasrānis .....	369
5.8.1. The Name Thomaschristians .....	369
5.8.2. The Name Nasrānis .....	372
5.9. The Non-Starters .....	379
5.9.1. The Thomaschristian Priesthood .....	379
5.9.2. The Law of Thomas .....	381
5.9.3. The St. Thomas Cross .....	385
5.9.4. Ancient Jewish Settlements .....	388
5.9.5. Brahmin Social Customs Among Thomaschristians .....	390
5.9.6. Christian Influence on Early Indian Religion? .....	391
5.9.6.1. Christ and the Krishna Cult .....	391
5.9.6.2. The Gospels and <i>Tirukkural</i> .....	392
5.9.7. Official Statements .....	393

### General Conclusion

1. East and West: the Twain Shall Never Meet? .....	397
2. <i>Videtur quod non</i> : Western Theories in Focus .....	398
3. The Early Qualified Witnesses .....	404
4. The Multifocus Indian Tradition .....	405
5. <i>Fioretti</i> : Tribute of Posterity to the Great .....	406
6. Convergence of Traditions as Proof .....	408
7. Historical Certainty .....	409
Selected Bibliography .....	411
Maps and Illustrations .....	415
Index .....	421

5.7.3.2. Contents .....	361
5.7.3.3. Historical Assessment .....	362
5.8. The South Indian Tradition (6): The Names Thomaschristians and Nasrānis .....	369
5.8.1. The Name Thomaschristians .....	369
5.8.2. The Name Nasrānis .....	372
5.9. The Non-Starters .....	379
5.9.1. The Thomaschristian Priesthood .....	379
5.9.2. The Law of Thomas .....	381
5.9.3. The St. Thomas Cross .....	385
5.9.4. Ancient Jewish Settlements .....	388
5.9.5. Brahmin Social Customs Among Thomaschristians .....	390
5.9.6. Christian Influence on Early Indian Religion? .....	391
5.9.6.1. Christ and the Krishna Cult .....	391
5.9.6.2. The Gospels and <i>Tirukkural</i> .....	392
5.9.7. Official Statements .....	393

### General Conclusion

1. East and West: the Twain Shall Never Meet? .....	397
2. <i>Videtur quod non</i> : Western Theories in Focus .....	398
3. The Early Qualified Witnesses .....	404
4. The Multifocus Indian Tradition .....	405
5. <i>Fioretti</i> : Tribute of Posterity to the Great .....	406
6. Convergence of Traditions as Proof .....	408
7. Historical Certainty .....	409
Selected Bibliography .....	411
Maps and Illustrations .....	415
Index .....	421