CONTENTS

		Page
Table of Cases		1
Chapters		
I. Understanding the Rights-Based disc	ourse: Opportun	ities
and Challenges	• •	• •
1. Introduction	• •	
2. Exploring the Human Rights Discou	rse	
3. Towards a Pluralistic History of Hur	nan Rights Discou	ırse .
4. Rhetoric, Politics, Ethics and Praxis	of Human Rights	
(A) The Rights Language Turn	• •	!
(B) Rights as Politics		14
(C) Rights as Ethics		19
(D) Rights as Praxis		22
II. Province of the Concept of Human Ri	ghts Determined	
Jurisprudential Overview	• •	25
1. Theoretical Basis for a Balanced Rights	Concept of Hu	man 25
2. Development of Human Rights I	over A Tilt in	
Balance	_aw. A Int III	26
3. Hohfeldian Scheme and Re-Balance	cing the Concept	t of
Human Rights		29
4. Concluding Remarks	• •	31
III. Reflections on the Internationalisation	of Penal Law	33
1. Penal Internationalisation		33
2. Jurisdictional Pluralism		34
3. Penal Culture(s)		35
4. Enforcement Problems		37
5. Penal Institutions In Crisis		38
6. Conclusions		40
IV. Symbolic Criminal Law without 1	Limits: A Gern	
Perspective	••	41
1. Context	• •	41
2. Critique of the Constitutional Court F	_	43
(A) Freedom rights and the principle	of commensurate	eness 44

IV. Sy		ic Criminal Law without Limits: A Ger spective (<i>Contd</i> .)	man	
	(B)	Delimitation of basic legal principles		45
	(C)	Pseudo-empirical grounding for interpretation	of the	
		law		48
	(D)	Normative contradictions and circular logic		51
	(E)	The ignorance of the damaging effects of drug p	olicy	51
	(F)	Crimes without victims — crimes without guilt		54
	(G)	The definition of harm by cumulating of non-har	rm	55
	(H)	The procedural law solution of de-penalisation		56
	(I)	Continued inequality of law in action		57
	(J)	Flexibility of the definition of "large quantities distribution	'' for	58
	(K)	Consumer responsibility with alcohol — not illegal drugs!	with	58
	(L)	Alcohol not conceived of as a psychoactive substa	ance	59
3.	The	Dissenting Votes		60
4.	Con	clusion		61
V. H	uman	Rights: Asian and Western Perspectives	• •	62
1.	Intro	oductory Remarks		62
2.	Phil	osophical Assumptions		64
3.	Non	h-South/East-West Perspectives		65
	(A)	Socio-economic Rights versus Civil and Pol	litical	65
	(B)	Absolutism versus Relativism: The 'Asian Va	dues'	
	()	Debate		67
	(C)	The Instrumentality of Democracy		69
	(D)	The Instrumentality of a Free Market Economy		70
	(E)	The Fountains of Freedom		71
	(F)	Human Rights and Religious Restraints		73
	(G)	Individualistic versus Collectivist Notions		74
	(H)	Rights and Duties		75
	(I)	Human Rights or Human Dignity?		75
	(J)	Human Rights and Private Centres of Power		76
4		ral Superiority of the West: Myth or reality?		77
		cluding Remarks		80

XLI

VI. Criminal Justice S	ystem in India –	 Bane of Hu 	ıman	
Rights	••	••	• •	82
1. Introduction	• •	••		82
2. Public Policy Issue	es	••		82
3. Police Reforms an	d Human Rights			87
4. Secessionist Move	ments, Terrorism a	nd Human Righ	ts	92
5. Summing Up				96
VII. Human Rights and t	he Criminal Justic	e Systems	• •	97
1. Introduction	• •		• •	97
2. Human Rights—A	Global Concern			97
3. Human Rights and	Criminal Justice S	ystem In India -	— A	
Legislative Para	digm	• •		99
4. Conclusion	••		• •	104
VIII. Human Rights and	Criminal Justice	Administration	n in	40=
India	• •	• •	• •	105
1. Introduction	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	ere Bindan Boin de le	· ·	105
2. Legislative Recognication India	nition to Human I	Rights Principle	s in	106
(A) Human Rights	· · Measures under th	e Constitution	••	106
(B) The General a				106
3. Judicial Evolution	-		·· ninal	100
Justice Administ	_			107
(A) Limitations on	the Power of Arre	st		107
(B) Ensuring Hum				108
	on Indiscriminate	_	and	
Fabrication of	of False Evidence			109
(D) New Rationali	sation of a Right to	Bail		110
(E) Limiting Police	e Remand	• •		111
(F) Recognizing a	Pre-sentence Hear	ing Right		112
(G) Restitutive Ser	ntencing			112
4. Criminal Justice Ad	lministration: Huma	an Rights Blind	Spots	113
(A) Excessive Pow	vers of Arrest			113
(B) Taking Citizer	's Liberty Lightly			114
(C) Sentencing Po	wer sans Guideline	s		115
(D) Differential Er	nforcement of Crim	inal Laws	• •	116
5. Conclusion			. ,	116

IX.	Human	Rights—A	Bird's-eye	View of the	e Indian	
	Pres	pective	••	• •	••	119
	1. Preli	minary Remai	ks	• •	• •	119
	2. Univ	ersal origin of	Human Rights	• •	• •	119
	3. Cond	cept of Duty a	nd Asian Value	s	• •	121
	4. Strug	ggle for Indep	endence	• •	• •	121
	5. Fund	lamental Righ	ts and Directive	Principles	• •	122
	6. Sum	ming up		• •	• •	127
X.	_		ccused—Some	Reflections	on the	
	Legi	islative Schen	ne in India	• •	• •	129
		duction		• •	• •	129
	2. Righ	its of the accu	sed — Some Re	eflections	• •	130
	(A)	Right to Life			• •	130
	(B)	Right to Spec	edy Trial	• •	• •	131
	(C)	Right to Cou	nsel		• •	132
	(D)	Right to Free	Legal Aid	• •		133
	(E)	The Right to	a Fair Trial	• •	• •	134
	(F)	Right against	Double Jeopar	dy		134
	(G)	Right agains	Self-incrimina	tion	• •	135
	(H)	Right agains	'Third-degree'	Methods		135
	(I)	Right to Fair	Treatment	• •		137
	3. Con	clusions		• •		139
XI.	Humár	Rights and	Criminal Just	ice System in	India: A	
	Ref	lection on the	ir Mutual Con	textual Nexus	• •	141
	1. Intro	oduction	• •	• •		141
	2. Gen	esis Of Huma	n Rights	• •		141
	3. Crir	ninal Justice S	ystem In India	••	• •	142
	(A)	Police and P	rosecution	• •	• •	142
	(B)	Non-registra	tion of Cases	• •		143
	(C)	Arbitrary Ar	rest	• •		144
	(D)	Custodial Ci	imes	• •		144
	(E)	Prisons			• •	145
	(F)	Delay in Dis	posal of Cases			147
	4. Cur	rent Correctio	nal Philosophy			148
	5. Hur	nan Rights Ini	tiatives in Priso	ns	• •	148
	6. Cor	clusion				150

Contents	XI	Ш
Contents	$\mathbf{X}\mathbf{I}$	Ш

XII. The Malimath Committee's Proposals for Reform Criminal Justice System in India: A Human Ri		
Reflection		152
1. Overview		152
2. The Pitfalls of the Malimath Committee's Proposed	Shift	
From An Adversarial To Inquisitorial System	• •	154
(A) The Danger of the Selective Incorporation	ı of	
Aspects of the Inquisitorial system	• •	154
(B) Summary of the Recommendations	• •	155
(i) Adverse inferences	• •	155
(ii) Defence statement	• •	155
(iii) Transforming Section 311		156
(iv) Standard of proof — inner conviction	• •	156
(ν) Investigative magistrate		156
(vi) Bad character evidence		157
(C) Seeking the Truth, or Simply More Convictions?		157
(D) The Effect of Removing the Right to Silence		158
(E) Delusions of Gender-sensitivity		159
3. Conclusion		163
XIII. Looking Back and Forging Ahead: Reflecting on National Human Rights Commission's (NHRC) St		
Report (1998-99)		164
1. Five Years in the Life of The Commission		164
2. The Complaint Jurisdiction		166
(A) The Overall Docket		166
(B) Illustrative cases		177
3. Human Rights Policies, Promotional Tasks and So	cio-	1,,
Economic Rights		194
(A) Policy concerns on Terrorism and State Atrocities	s	194
(B) Social Justice Concerns		196
(C) Statutory Reform and Treaties		197
(D) Public Education Liaison and Logistic Support		198
4. Into the Next Millennium		199
XIV. Protection of Human Rights through Public Inte	rest	• > >
Litigation in India		200
1. Introduction		200

XIV. Protection of Human Rights throu Litigation in India (Contd.)	igh Public Inte	erest	
2. The Evolution of PIL			200
3. Features of PIL			202
4. Governmental lawlessness and repres	ssion		203
(A) Custodial Violence	• •		203
(B) Terrorism and Insurgency			206
(C) Violence against Women			207
(D) Bonded Labour			209
(E) Children	• •		210
5. Role of National Human Rights Com	nmission (NHRC)	212
(A) Composition	• •		212
(B) Functions, Powers and Procedu	re		212
(C) Performance of the NHRC	• •		213
(i) Terrorism and Insurgency	• •		213
(ii) Custodial Deaths, Rape and	Torture		213
(iii) Systematic Reform: Police	e, Prisons and	other	
Centres of Detention		• •	214
(iv) Handling of Complaints: Illu	ustrative Cases		214
6. Concluding Remarks			217
XV. Abuse of Investigatory Powers: 'Po India in Pursuit of Safeguarding	_		
Accused in the Criminal Process	••	••	219
1. Introduction	• •		219
2. The Police and The Use Of Force:	The Legal Regir	ne In	
India—A Paradigm	• •	• •	220
3. 'Policing' the Police: Legisla Institutional Approach	itive, Judicial	and	227
(A) Legislative Approach: Existing	and Dronocad	• •	227
(B) Protection of Human Rights	=	iahte'	221
Institution	Act, 1993. A K	ignts	232
(C) Judicial Approach			233
(D) Approach of the Nation	nal Human F	Rights	
Commission		••	237
4. 'Police Excesses' & 'Custodial Vio	lence': Accounta	bility	
Of The Police	• •	• •	238
5. Conclusion			240

Contents X	L١	V
------------	----	---

XVI. Law of Confession and Right against Torture: Balar Societal Interest and Individual's Right—Need		
Legislative Action		243
1. Introductory Remarks		243
2. Human Rights against Torture		244
3. Confession		245
4. Confession and State Acts		247
5. Conclusion and Suggestions		249
XVII. Towards a Human Rights' Friendly Police—A Bluepr	rint	253
1. Introduction		253
2. Causes for Popular Dissatisfaction with Police		253
3. What can be done and by whom?		254
(A) Reforms from Within the Police		254
(B) Reforms that the Government has to Undertake		255
(C) Reforms which People themselves can Initiate		256
4. Conclusion		256
XVIII. The Death Penalty: International and Human Ri	_	
Perspectives on the Future of Capital Punishment		257
1. Introduction: The Death Penalty—Ongoing Concerns		257
2. The Legal Framework of Imposing and Enforcing		
Death Penalty, Political Developments and Empiritude Information on Executions	ncal	258
(A) The Legal Framework of the Death Penalty	• •	258
(B) Capital Punishment in Practice	• •	260
3. International and European Penal Policies and the De	eath	200
Penalty		261
4. Problems of Threatening, Imposing and Enforcing	the	
Death Penalty from A Human Rights Perspective		262
(A) Introduction		262
(B) Equal Treatment, Arbitrariness and the Death Pena	ılty	265
(C) The Death Penalty and the Question of Deterrenc	e	267
(D) The Death Penalty and Public Opinion		268
(E) The Imposition of the Death Penalty and the Righ	nt to	
have a Fair Trial	• •	269
(F) The Death Penalty and Possible Errors in Judgme	ent	269
5. Summary		270

XIX.	Delayed Rigi	d Execution of Death Sentenc hts-oriented Jurisprudence an	e in India: A Hui d Jurists' Pruder	man nce	272
	1. Sent	ence Of Death: Legislative and	Judicial Policy		272
		y In Execution Of Death Sente actor and the Supreme Court			
		rinciples			275
	3. Con	cluding Remarks	• •		283
XX.	Prison	as Punishment—Time for a N	ew Approach?	• •	286
	1. Intro	oduction			286
	2. The	Spread of Imprisonment			286
	3. The	Scope of Imprisonment Today	• •		287
	4. The	Problems Associated with Impr	isonment		289
	(A)	Overcrowding	• •		289
	(B)	Infection and Disease	• •		291
	(C)	Human Rights Abuses			291
	(D)	Vulnerable Groups			292
	(E)	Discrimination			293
	5. Inte	rnational Human Rights Framev	work		293
	6. Pris	on Reforms and The Internation	al Standards		295
	7. Red	ucing the use of Imprisonment			296
	8. Red	uctions in the Prison Population	١		297
		Reducing Pre-trial Detention	• •		297
	(B)	Alternatives to Prison			298
	9. Imp	orisonment and Development Po	licy		299
	10. Res	torative Justice	••		300
	11. Cor	nclusions	• •		301
XXI	. Huma	n Rights, Constitutions and	Prisoners: A G	iobal	
	Per	spective	••	• •	302
	1. Intr	oduction	• •		302
	2. Pris	soners' and Human Rights: A Gl	lobal Perspective		302
	(A)	Governments constantly emp	hasise the 'Proble	m of	202
	(P)	Crime'	••	• •	302
		Prison Populations			303
		Traditional View: Prisoners de	o not have Rights	••	304
		International Developments	• •	• •	305
	(E)	Changes in Attitudes			306

Contents XLVII

XXI. Human Rights, Constitutions and Prisoners: A Perspective (Contd.)	Global	
3. Prisoners' Human Rights: A Survey Of Const	itutional	
Perspectives		30
(A) Recent Constitutions	• •	30′
(B) Some Constitutions of the 1990s		30
(C) What Rights might Prisoners Claim?		309
(i) Due Process		310
(ii) Special forms of constraint		310
(iii) Physical security of prisoners		31.
(iv) Access to reading matter		314
(ν) Voting		314
(vi) Access to the media		317
(vii) Sex and family life		318
(viii) Privacy		318
(ix) HIV positive prisoners		319
(x) Religious observance		320
(xi) Consideration for parole		321
(xii) Privatisation	• •	321
(xiii) Monitoring and complaints		322
(xiv) Other rights	• •	323
4. Conclusion and Suggestions		324
XXII. Human Rights of Prisoners	• •	327
1. Introduction		327
The Kirit Ravjibhai Rawal Custodial Death case		327
2. The Human Rights Context in Prisons	• •	328
(A) Overcrowding		328
(B) Inadequate Provision for Basic Needs		329
(C) Torture, Ill-treatment and Repressive Control		329
(D) Unequal Treatment and Privileges		330
3. Judicial Initiatives in Securing Prisoner's Rights		331
4. Conclusion — A Recipe for Prisoners' Human Observance	Rights	334

XIII. Compu	lsory Hard P	rison Labo	our and the	Prisoners'
	nt to Receive icial Voices	wages: C	onstitutionai	rires and
_	duction		• •	
	pulsory Hard	Prison Labo	ur and The Inc	dian Penal
	ode: A Sketch C			
3. 'For	ced Labour': Co	onstitutional	Scheme and Sp	irit
to	npulsory Hard For Receive Wage			
	oices	· ·		
(A)	Compulsory I Vires and Jud			istitutional
(B)	Prisoners' Ri Quantificatio Judicial Tone	n of Wages	ceive Wages Constitutional	
	(i) Does a pris his labour		e right to claim	wages for
((ii) Does a p 'reasonab labour?		e the right to nimum' wage	
5. Con	clusion			
XIV. Justice	to Victims of C	Crime: A Hu	ıman Rights A	pproach
1. Intro	oduction			• •
2. Que	st for Justice to	Victims of	Crime	
3. Con	npensation to Vi	ctims of Cri	me	
(A)	Compensation	under the Fa	atal Accidents A	ct, 1855
(B)	Compensation	under the M	lotor Vehicles A	ct, 1988
(C)	Compensation 1973	under the	Criminal Proceed	dure Code,
	(i) Compensat	ion as mitiga	ting factor	• •
	_	sation for m	-	• •
	-	isation for se		• •
(D)	Constitutional			Rights
(D)	Violations	··		Aigins
(E)	Compensation 1958	under the P	robation of Offe	enders Act,
4. Con	clusion and Sug	gestions		

ontents	XL	\mathbf{L}	X	
ontents	XL	Ι.		X

XXV. Victim Compens for a Victim-	sation Law and Cr Orientation in Crin			362
1. Introduction	• •			362
2. Justice for Vi	ctims of Crime: A	Requirement o		
Rights	• •	••		363
3. Victim Compe	ensation and the Law	in India: A Sl	cetch	363
4. Victim Compe	ensation Fund — Pro	posed Paradig	m	365
(A) The Com	pensation Board			365
(B) Computa	tion of Compensatio	on	• •	367
5. Conclusion	• •		• •	368
XXVI. Justice to Victi	ims of Crime: E	merging Tre	nds and	
Legislative M	odels in India	• •	:	370
1. Introduction	• •		3	370
	ctims of Crime an		nal Law	
•	ndia: Legislative Fra		3	374
	~	of Crime:	Existing	
-	ive Spirit and Scher			375
• 7	ode of Criminal Pro			375
	obation of Offender			377
	covery and the paym	_		378
	icacy of the compensions	ensatory schem		379
-	ion of Crime Victim	 s in Criminal I		380
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	ctims Of Crime A			,00
	India: Emerging T			
Paradigms				381
(A) Compensa	ation as an 'additio	nal punishmer	nt' under	
the IPC?				382
	ensive Statutory &			
	Compensatory Schen			384
• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	to seek State Assist			387
	e Victim Participato	ory in Crimina		200
Model?	··	• •		388 202
4. Concluding Rea	marks	• •		392
SUBJECT INDEX	• •	• •	3	396