

# Contents

Preface and Acknowledgements .....	xiii
Bibliography	
1. Primary Sources .....	1
2. Secondary Sources.....	11

## PART I – INTRODUCTION

### Introduction

1. The Importance of the Bahirarthaparīkṣā Chapter in the <i>Tattvasaṅgraha</i> and the <i>Tattvasaṅgrahapañjikā</i> .....	41
2. Śubhagupta and the * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> as Introduced in the <i>Tattvasaṅgraha</i> and the <i>Tattvasaṅgrahapañjikā</i>	
2.1 Quotations and Use of Materials from the * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> .....	48
2.2 Steinkellner’s Method of Classification: The “Autocommentary” as <i>Citatum in Alio</i> <i>Modo Referendi</i> (Where the * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> is <b>T</b> ).....	50
2.3 The Case of Haribhadra Sūri .....	52
2.4 The Intended and Ideal Audience for Criticism of Śubhagupta .....	52
2.5 Śubhagupta’s Doctrinal Affiliation.....	54
3. The Examination of External Objects of Perception in the Bahirarthaparīkṣā	
3.1 Proof in Favor of <i>Vijñaptimātratā</i> in the Bahirarthaparīkṣā .....	56
3.2 The Dravyapadārthaparīkṣā: The View of Externalism as a Step Within the Cultivation of <i>Cintāmayī Prajñā</i> .....	59
3.3 Positions on the Nature of an External Object: Śāntarakṣita and Kamalaśīla .....	66
3.4 Theses on the Nature of an External Object: Vasubandhu and Diñnāga.....	67

4. The Apprehensibility of Atoms: Śāntarakṣita, Kamalāśīla and Śubhagupta	
4.1 Atoms and Their Proof Through Direct Perception: The Vijñānavāda “Epistemic Proof” in the Bahirarthaparīkṣā; * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> kk. 35 and 44 as Quoted in the Bahirarthaparīkṣā.....	71
4.2 Rebuttal of the Vijñānavāda “Epistemic Proof” by Śubhagupta: * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> 35 in Its Original Context.....	76
4.3 Apprehension with No Ascertainment: The “Epistemic Proof” Disproven in the Dravyapadārthaparīkṣā.....	78
4.4 Apprehension with No Ascertainment: The “Epistemic Proof” Disproven in * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> 36–37.....	81
4.5 An Instance of Intentional “Misrepresenting”: <i>Tattvasaṅgraha</i> 1974 and <i>Tattvasaṅgrahapañjikā</i> .....	82
4.6 Atoms as Ultimately Real in Terms of Being Causally Efficient: * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> 39, 57 and 58.....	84
5. Śāntarakṣita, Kamalāśīla and Śubhagupta on the Singularity of Atoms	
5.1 Proving the Unreality of Atoms: <i>Tattvasaṅgraha</i> 1989–1991 and <i>Tattvasaṅgrahapañjikā</i> .....	86
5.2 Vasubandhu’s Refutation of <i>Samhata</i> (Aggregated) Atoms as Objects of Sense Cognitions: <i>Vimśikā</i> and <i>Abhidharmakośabhāṣya</i> .....	88
5.3 Śubhagupta’s Theory on the Aggregation of Atoms.....	92
5.4 Śubhagupta’s Response to the “ <i>Digbhāgabhedavattva</i> ” Argument: * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> kk. 45cd, 46, 47, 48.....	93
5.5 Temporal Continuity Versus Spatial Continuity: Śubhagupta as Introduced in <i>Tattvasaṅgrahapañjikā ad Tattvasaṅgraha</i> 1989–1991 and * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> 50–51.....	97
5.6 Kamalāśīla’s Response.....	99
5.7 <i>Grāhya</i> Proven as Illogical: Conclusion of Argument A.....	103

6. Features of Cognition According to Śubhagupta	
6.1 Śubhagupta as the Buddhist	
<i>Nirākāravādin par Excellence</i> in the <i>Bahirarthaparīkṣā</i> .....	104
6.2 Nature ( <i>Svabhāva</i> ) of Cognition:	
* <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> kk. 89, 84, 66, 81 .....	106
6.3 Features of Cognition as Based on	
the Ontological Nature of Its Object.....	111
6.4 Analogous Arguments Against the <i>Sākāravāda</i>	
in the <i>Tattvasaṅgraha</i> and the <i>Tattvasaṅgrahapañjikā</i> .....	116
7. Conclusion – Defining Śubhagupta’s	
Doctrinal Affiliation: <i>Kim Prayojanam?</i> .....	118

## PART II – BAHIRARTHAPARĪKṢĀ

### Manuscripts and Editions of the

#### *Tattvasaṅgraha* and the *Tattvasaṅgrahapañjikā*

1. Manuscripts of the <i>Tattvasaṅgraha</i> .....	123
2. Manuscripts of the <i>Tattvasaṅgrahapañjikā</i> .....	132
3. Stemma Codicum.....	140
4. Printed Editions.....	140

### Symbols and Abbreviations

1. Sigla Related to the Sources Used in the Critical Edition.....	143
2. Editorial Conventions: Symbols and Abbreviations.....	145

### Prolegomenon

1. Critical Edition.....	149
2. Tibetan Translations.....	150
3. <i>Post Correctionem</i> .....	151
4. Homographic <i>Akṣaras</i> and Orthography.....	151
5. Jk/Jp.....	152
6. Pk/Pp.....	152
7. K.....	152
8. Other.....	152
9. Pā/Gā.....	153
10. Parallel Passages.....	153
11. Glosses.....	154

## Bahirarthaparīkṣā – Sanskrit Text

1. Introduction.....	155
2. Argument A: <i>Grāhyāyogāt</i>	
2.1 Pūrvapakṣa .....	157
2.2 Refutation of External Objects as <i>Grāhya</i> .....	157
2.3 Proof Denying the Existence of Atoms .....	166
3. Argument B: <i>Grāhyagrāhaka lakṣaṇavaidhuryāt</i> .....	173
3.1 Proof of the Self-Awareness of Cognitions.....	174
3.2 Refutation of the <i>Nirākāravāda</i> .....	175
3.3. Refutation of the <i>Sākāravāda</i> .....	197
3.4 Refutation of the <i>Anyākāravāda</i> .....	199
4. Rejection of the <i>Pramāṇas</i> Proving External Objects .....	204
5. Conclusion .....	217
Glosses .....	223

## Investigation of External Objects – English Translation

1. Introduction.....	227
2. Argument A: <i>Grāhyāyogāt</i>	
2.1 Pūrvapakṣa .....	230
2.2 Refutation of External Objects as <i>Grāhya</i> .....	230
2.3 Proof Denying the Existence of Atoms .....	245
3. Argument B: <i>Grāhyagrāhaka lakṣaṇavaidhuryāt</i> .....	256
3.1 Proof of the Self-Awareness of Cognitions.....	257
3.2 Refutation of the <i>Nirākāravāda</i> .....	260
3.3. Refutation of the <i>Sākāravāda</i> .....	292
3.4. Refutation of the <i>Anyākāravāda</i> .....	296
4. Rejection of the <i>Pramāṇas</i> Proving External Objects .....	301
5. Conclusion.....	318

## PART III – \*BĀHYĀRTHASIDDHIKĀRIKĀ

Appendix 1: Reuse of Materials from the * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> .....	327
Appendix 2: Survey of Previous Research on Śubhagupta and the * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> .....	333
Introduction to Appendix 3 and 4: * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> by Śubhagupta .....	343

Appendix 3: * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> of Śubhagupta Tibetan Text of kk. 2–8; 29; 32–58; 66; 68; 71–74; 77–92; 95; 101; 185.....	345
Appendix 4: * <i>Bāhyārthasiddhikārikā</i> of Śubhagupta English Translation of kk. 2–8; 29; 32–58; 66; 68; 71–74; 77–92; 95; 101; 185.....	351
Index of Works .....	359
Index of Authors .....	362
Index of Quoted Passages (and their Translations) .....	364
Index of Terms .....	373