To: Ms. Tereza Cristina Correa da Costa Dias, Minister of Agriculture Ministry of Agriculture gm@agricultura.gov.br; agenda.gm@agricultura.gov.br; juliana.felicio@agricultura.gov.br;

Mr. Eduardo Pazuello, Minister of Health Ministry of Health; <u>chefia.gm@saude.gov.br;</u> <u>Gabmin@saude.gov.br;</u> <u>Pazuello@saude.gov.br</u>

CC:

Mr. Antonio Élcio Franco, Executive Secretary of Ministry of Health; gabinete.se@saude.gov.br

Mr. Raphael Parente, Secretary of Primary Attention on Health of Ministry of Health; aps@saude.gov.br

Mr. César Hanna Halum, Secretary of Agro Policies of Ministry of Agriculture spa@agricultura.gov.br

Mr. Luis Eduardo Pacifici Rangel, Director of SAEP/SPA of Ministry of Agriculture luis.angel@agricultura.gov.br

Ref.: Brazilian Dietary Guidelines

September 23, 2020

Dear Minister Tereza Cristina Corrêa da Costa Dias,

As scholars involved with research and public policy on healthy diets across the globe, we are very concerned by the Technical Note No 42/2020/DAEP/SPA/MAPA issued by the Secretary for Agricultural Policy and the Department of Economic Analysis and Public Policies from the Brazilian Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply.

The Note, evidently written without a clear understanding of the scientific research on this topic, raises several unjustified criticisms of the *Brazilian Dietary Guidelines* issued by the Ministry of Health (1). It is accompanied by the draft of a letter addressed to the Minister of Health, with a request for an urgent and complete review of the guidelines. The draft indicated that the letter would be signed by you. We ask you to remove this request, and briefly explain why here.

Using the NOVA food classification system (2), the *Brazilian Dietary Guidelines* recommend healthy meals based on well-developed and established national and regional dietary patterns, as

are still consumed by a large segment of the Brazilian population. These are made up from a variety of fresh or minimally processed foods, prepared with small amounts of processed culinary ingredients (salt, sugar, oils, and fats). Processed foods, such as bread and cheese, also in small amounts, are consumed as part of dishes and meals based on fresh or minimally processed foods.

The *Guidelines* recommend avoidance of ultra-processed foods. These are precisely defined by the NOVA food classification and in the *Dietary Guidelines*. They include soft drinks, sweet or salted snacks, sugared breakfast cereals, reconstituted meat products, and pre-prepared ready-to(h)eat dishes and meals. The less of these are eaten the better.

It is hard to understand why the Note does not mention the rapid recent growth in consumption of ultra-processed foods throughout Brazil, and in most countries in the world, nor the negative health impact of these foods.

Consumption of ultra-processed foods in Brazil and in all countries where their impact has been studied, has been shown to be the main driver of high energy-dense diets and inadequate nutrient intakes, both of which are related to a number of diet-related non-communicable diseases, as summarized in a recent FAO report (3).

The association of ultra-processed food consumption with overweight and obesity, diabetes, hypertension, dyslipidemias, cardiovascular diseases, stroke, breast cancer, depression, elderly frailty and all-cause mortality has been demonstrated by careful longitudinal studies conducted in large samples of individuals from different countries including the USA, the UK, Spain and France as well as Brazil (4-21).

Many countries including France, Israel, Canada, Mexico, Chile, and Uruguay are using NOVA as a tool to educate their populations and as a basis for national food and nutrition policies and programs designed to improve food systems and public health.

In the USA the National Institutes of Health has conducted a randomized controlled trial (22) whose results show beyond doubt that increased consumption of ultra-processed foods causes excessive energy intake and weight gain. The Director of the National Institutes of Health, Francis Collins, has stated on this study: 'It appears that a good place to start in reaching or maintaining a healthy weight is to... work to eliminate or at least reduce ultra-processed foods in your diet in favor of a balanced variety of unprocessed, nutrient-packed foods'(23). This study is of special importance now because science is clear on the fact that overweight and obesity increases substantially the risk of serious suffering and death from Covid-19 (24).

The Technical Note has no valid foundation. It ignores the fact that the *Brazilian Dietary Guidelines*, supervised by the multi-professional team working for the Ministry of Health Food and Nutrition Coordination unit (CGAN), were the subject of consultation with health and food and nutrition scholars and professionals from all Brazilian states and with several stakeholders including the food industry, before approval by the then Minister of Health.

The Note asserts that the NOVA food system classification used by the *Guidelines* '... is confusing, incoherent, and hinders the implementation of adequate guidelines to promote adequate and healthy nutrition for the Brazilian population'. This claim is not supported. It asserts that ultra-processed foods are harmless, using a reference that did not evaluate these foods. It makes the wild claim that the *Brazilian Dietary Guidelines* is one of the worst in the planet, despite their acknowledgement by United Nations agencies and practically universal acclaim and support. It claims that it is comical to define ultra-processed foods by the number of ingredients they contain, which is untrue; the presence of five or more ingredients is merely a practical way to identify those foods. Their definition is precisely stated in the guidelines.

We can supply you with more documentation on and assessments of the *Brazilian Dietary Guidelines* and the NOVA food classification as now used all over the world, at your request. Sincerely,

Signatures on the next page

- Brazilian Ministry of Health (2014) Dietary Guidelines for the Brazilian Population. Brasília: Ministry of Health; available at http://189.28.128.100/dab/docs/portaldab/ publicacoes/guia_alimentar_populacao_ingles.pdf
- Monteiro C.A., et al., The UN Decade of Nutrition, the NOVA food classification and the trouble with ultra-processing. Public Health Nutr. 2018;21(1):5-17. doi:10.1017/S1368980017000234
- 3. Monteiro, C.A., et al., Ultra-processed foods, diet quality, and health using the NOVA classification system. Rome, FAO, 2019.
- 4. Rauber, F., et al., Consumption of ultra-processed food products and its effects on children's lipid profiles: a longitudinal study. Nutrition, Metabolism and Cardiovascular Diseases, 2015. 25(1): p. 116-122.
- 5. Fiolet, T., et al., Consumption of ultra-processed foods and cancer risk: results from NutriNet-Santé prospective cohort. bmj, 2018. 360: p. k322.
- 6. Mendonça, R.d.D., et al., Ultraprocessed food consumption and risk of overweight and obesity: the University of Navarra Follow-Up (SUN) cohort study. The American journal of clinical nutrition, 2016. 104(5): p. 1433-1440.
- Adjibade, M., et al., Prospective association between ultra-processed food consumption and incident depressive symptoms in the French NutriNet-Santé cohort. BMC medicine, 2019. 17(1): p. 78.
- 8. Costa, C., et al., Ultra-processed food consumption and its effects on anthropometric and glucose profile: A longitudinal study during childhood. Nutrition, Metabolism and Cardiovascular Diseases, 2019. 29(2): p. 177-184.

- Gómez-Donoso, C., et al., Ultra-processed food consumption and the incidence of depression in a Mediterranean cohort: The SUN Project. European journal of nutrition, 2019: p. 1-11.
- Kim, H., E.A. Hu, and C.M. Rebholz, Ultra-processed food intake and mortality in the USA: Results from the Third National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey (NHANES III, 1988–1994). Public health nutrition, 2019. 22(10): p. 1777-1785.
- Mendonça, R.d.D., et al., Ultra-processed food consumption and the incidence of hypertension in a Mediterranean cohort: the Seguimiento Universidad de Navarra Project. American journal of hypertension, 2017. 30(4): p. 358-366.
- 12. Rico-Campà, A., et al., Association between consumption of ultra-processed foods and all cause mortality: SUN prospective cohort study. bmj, 2019. 365: p. 11949.
- Rohatgi, K.W., et al., Relationships between consumption of ultra-processed foods, gestational weight gain and neonatal outcomes in a sample of US pregnant women. PeerJ, 2017. 5: p. e4091.
- 14. Sandoval-Insausti, H., et al., Ultra-processed Food Consumption and Incident Frailty: A Prospective Cohort Study of Older Adults. The Journals of Gerontology: Series A, 2019.
- Schnabel, L., et al., Association between ultraprocessed food consumption and risk of mortality among middle-aged adults in France. JAMA internal medicine, 2019. 179(4): p. 490-498.
- 16. Srour, B., et al., Ultra-processed food intake and risk of cardiovascular disease: prospective cohort study (NutriNet-Santé). bmj, 2019. 365: p. 11451.
- 17. Vandevijvere, S., et al., Global trends in ultraprocessed food and drink product sales and their association with adult body mass index trajectories. Obesity Reviews, 2019.
- Beslay, M., et al., Ultra-processed food intake in association with BMI change and risk of overweight and obesity: A prospective analysis of the French NutriNet-Santé cohort. PLoS medicine, 2020. 17(8): p. e1003256.
- Montero-Salazar, H., et al., High consumption of ultra-processed food may double the risk of subclinical coronary atherosclerosis: the Aragon Workers' Health Study (AWHS). BMC medicine, 2020. 18(1): p. 1-11.
- 20. Sandoval-Insausti H., et al., Ultra-Processed Food Consumption Is Associated with Abdominal Obesity: A Prospective Cohort Study in Older Adults. Nutrients. 2020;12(8):2368. Published 2020 Aug 7. doi:10.3390/nu12082368.
- Rauber F., et al., Ultra-processed food consumption and risk of obesity: a prospective cohort study of UK Biobank. European Journal of Nutrition, 2020. DOI: 10.1007/s00394-020-02367-1.
- Hall, K.D., Ultra-processed diets cause excess calorie intake and weight gain: A onemonth inpatient randomized controlled trial of ad libitum food intake. Cell Metabolism, 2019 30: p. 1-10.
- 23. US National Institutes of Health, 21 May 2019. Collins, F. Ultra-processed diet leads to extra calories, weight gain. https://directorsblog.nih.gov/ 2019/05/21/ultra-processed-diet-leads-to-extra-calories-weight-gain/

24. Popkin B., et al., Individuals with obesity and COVID-19: A global perspective on the epidemiology and biological relationships. Obesity Reviews. 2020; 1–17. https://doi.org/10.1111/obr.13128

Barry M. Popkin, PhD W. R. Kenan, Jr. Distinguished Professor of Nutrition University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill popkin@unc.edu

Frank Chaloupka Research Professor of Economics Director, Health Policy Center University of Illinois at Chicago <u>fic@uic.edu</u>

Ricardo Uauy, MD, PhD Professor and Former Director INTA University of Chile <u>Ricardo.Uauy@lshtm.ac.uk</u>

Juan Rivera Dommarco, PhD Director Centro de Investigacion en Nutricion y Salud Instituto Nacional de Salud Pública Mexico jrivera@insp.mx

Karen Hofman, MB BCh, FAAP Director, Priority Cost Effective Lessons for Systems Strengthening Professor, School of Public Health University of the Witwatersrand Karen.Hofman@wits.ac.za

Walter Willett, MD, DrPH Professor of Nutrition and Epidemiology Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health wwillett@hsph.harvard.edu

Dr. Tim Lobstein Director of Policy World Obesity Federation London tlobstein@worldobesity.org

Professor Corinna Hawkes, PhD Centre for Food Policy City University of London Corinna.Hawkes@city.ac.uk Professor Tim Lang, PhD FFPH Centre for Food Policy City University of London t.lang@city.ac.uk

Frank Hu, MD, PhD Professor of Nutrition and Epidemiology Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health <u>frank.hu@channing.harvard.edu</u>

Carlos A. Camargo, MD DrPH Professor of Emergency Medicine & Medicine Harvard Medical School, Prof. of Epidemiology Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health Conn Chair in Emergency Medicine Massachusetts General Hospital ccamargo@partners.org

Lawrence J. Appel, MD, MPH Professor of Medicine, Epidemiology, and International Health (Human Nutrition) Director, Welch Center for Prevention, Epidemiology, and Clinical Research Johns Hopkins Medical Institutions lappel@jhmi.edu

Marion Nestle Professor of Nutrition, Food Studies, and Public Health New York University <u>marion.nestle@nyu.edu</u>

John D. Potter MD PhD Member and Senior Advisor Division of Public Health Sciences Fred Hutchinson Cancer Research Center Professor Emeritus of Epidemiology University of Washington jpotter@fredhutch.org Michael I Goran, PhD Director, Childhood Obesity Research Center Co-Director USC Diabetes and Obesity Research Institute Professor of Preventive Medicine; Physiology & Biophysics; and Pediatrics The Dr. Robert C. & Veronica Atkins Chair in Childhood Obesity & Diabetes USC Keck School of Medicine goran@usc.edu

David L. Katz, MD, MPH President, American College of Lifestyle Medicine Founder, True Health Initiative Associate Professor of Public Health Yale University School of Medicine <u>david.katz@yale.edu</u>

Jennifer L. Harris, PhD, MBA Director of Marketing Initiatives Rudd Center for Food Policy & Obesity Associate Professor Allied Health Sciences University of Connecticut Jennifer.harris@uconn.edu

Kelly Brownell, PhD Dean of the Sanford School of Public Policy Robert L. Flowers Professor of Public Policy Professor of Psychology and Neuroscience Professor in the Sanford School of Public Policy Duke University kelly.brownell@duke.edu

Simon Capewell, MD, DSc Vice President UK Faculty of Public Health Professor of Clinical Epidemiology University of Liverpool, UK capewell@liverpool.ac.uk

Dr. Simón Barquera Director, Centro de Investigación en Nutrición y Salud Instituto Nacional de Salud Pública, Mexico sbarquera@correo.insp.mx

Dr. Anne Marie Thow Senior Lecturer in Health Policy Menzies Centre for Health Policy Boyd Swinburn, MD Professor of Population Nutrition and Global Health University of Auckland, New Zealand Alfred Deakin Professor, Global Obesity Centre (GLOBE) Deakin University, Australia Co-Chair World Obesity, Policy and Prevention Section boyd.swinburn@auckland.ac.nz

Oliver Mytton UKCRC Centre for Diet and Activity Research (CEDAR) Department of MRC Epidemiology University of Cambridge School of Clinical Medicine Institute of Metabolic Science otm21@medschl.cam.ac.uk

David Hammond, PhD Professor and CIHR Chair in Applied Public Health School of Public Health University of Waterloo, Canada <u>dhammond@uwaterloo.ca</u>

Jean-Pierre Després Director of Cardiology Research Québec City Heart and Lung Institute Research Centre Professor, Department of Kinesiology Faculty of Medicine Université Laval Jean-Pierre.Despres@criucpq.ulaval.ca

Yoni Freedhoff Associate Professor Dept. of Family Medicine University of Ottawa <u>drfreedhoff@bmimedical.ca</u>

Jean-Claude Moubarac Assistant Professor Department of Nutrition Université de Montréal jc.moubarac@umontreal.ca

Rina Swart PhD, RD (SA) Professor Department of Dietetics and Nutrition The University of Sydney, Australia annemarie.thow@sydney.edu.au

Gastón Ares Associate Professor in Sensometrics and Consumer science at Universidad de la República (Uruguay) gares@fq.edu.uy

Mary L'Abbé Professor at the Department of Nutritional Sciences Faculty of Medicine University of Toronto <u>Mary.Labbe@utoronto.ca</u> University of the Western Cape South Africa rswart@uwc.ac.za

Dr. Giota Mitrou Acting Director of Science and Public Affairs World Cancer Research Fund International <u>g.mitrou@wcrf.org</u>

Gyorgy Scrinis Professor of Food and Nutrition Politics and Policy at the University of Melbourne gyorgys@unimelb.edu.au

Luis Fernando Gómez Gutiérrez Professor of public health School of Medicine of the Universidad Javeriana in Bogotá l.gomezg@javeriana.edu.co