HYDRODYNAMIZATION AND ASYMPTOTICS: THE EARLY TO LATE TIMES IN RELATIVISTIC HYDRODYNAMICS

Inês Aniceto

(with D. Hasenbichler and A. Olde Daalhuis)

Nonperturbative Methods in QFT, 25 April 2022



Engineering and Physical Sciences Research Council



 $\sum E_n g^n$ n=0

RELATIVISTIC HYDRODYNAMICS

Provides a reliable description of strongly coupled systems close to thermal equilibrium

Real life: strongly coupled quark-gluon plasma in particle accelerators;

To determine the kinetic parameters of hydrodynamic equations (e.g. shear viscosity): study the associated microscopic theory

• The associated microscopic theory can be a QFT, such as strongly coupled $\mathcal{N} = 4$ Super Yang-Mills (SYM), studied via holography [Heller, Janik, Witaszczyk' 11,'13; IA, Meiring, Jankowski, Spalinski' 18]

• Other microscopic models have been studied

[Romatschke'17; Strickland, Noronha, Denicol'17]

STRONGLY COUPLED SYSTEMS

Kinematic regime: **expanding plasma** in the so-called central rapidity region, where one assumes **longitudinal boost invariance** (Bjorken flow) [Bjorken '83]

In hydrodynamic theories the energy-momentum tensor is given by

$$T^{\mu\nu} = \mathcal{E} u^{\mu} u^{\nu} + \mathcal{P}(\mathcal{E})(\eta^{\mu\nu} + u^{\mu} u^{\nu}) + (\Pi^{\mu\nu})$$

Energy density —

Pressure, in 4d conformal theories given by:

 $\mathcal{P}(\mathcal{E}) = \mathcal{E}/3$

Shear stress tensor: dissipative effects

flow velocity

Symmetries: <u>conformal invariance</u>, <u>transversely homogeneous</u>, invariance under longitudinal Lorentz boosts

STRONGLY COUPLED SYSTEMS

Kinematic regime: **expanding plasma** in the so-called central rapidity region, where one assumes **longitudinal boost invariance** (Bjorken flow) [Bjorken '83]

In hydrodynamic theories the energy-momentum tensor is given by

$$T^{\mu\nu} = \mathcal{E} u^{\mu} u^{\nu} + \mathcal{P}(\mathcal{E})(\eta^{\mu\nu} + u^{\mu} u^{\nu}) + \Pi^{\mu\nu}$$

Strongly coupled boost invariant plasma: **all physics encoded in** $\mathcal{E}(\tau)$. Obtaining this function is in general too difficult: perform a **large proper time expansion** $\tau \gg 1$.

LATE TIME BEHAVIOUR

Starting from highly non-equilibrium initial conditions, the microscopic theory will reveal the transition to hydrodynamic behaviour at late times

Conformal theories: late-time behaviour of energy density highly constrained

$$\mathcal{E}(\tau) = \frac{\Lambda}{(\Lambda\tau)^{1/3}} \left(1 + \sum_{k=1}^{+\infty} \frac{\epsilon_k}{(\Lambda\tau)^{2k/3}} \right), \ \tau \gg 1$$

- Λ is a dimensionful parameter encoding initial non-eq. conditions
- Leading behaviour predicted by boost-invariant perfect fluid
- Subleading terms: dissipative hydrodynamic effects



MIS CAUSAL HYDRODYNAMICS

Müller-Israel-Stewart (MIS) approach

- embed hydrodynamics in a framework compatible with relativistic causality;
- introduces non-hydrodynamic degrees of freedom;
- means of generating the hydrodynamic gradient expansion, studied as if it came from a microscopic theory

MIS CAUSAL HYDRODYNAMICS

Solve evolution equations of the Energy momentum tensor

 $\nabla_{\mu}T^{\mu\nu} = 0$

- Assume boost invariant flow, conformal invariance
- Hydrodynamic gradient expansion: approximate shear stress tensor by corrections to ideal fluid

Müller-Israel-Stuart (MIS) equations

$$z C_{\tau\Pi} f f' + 4C_{\tau\Pi} f^2 + \left(z - \frac{16C_{\tau\Pi}}{3}\right) f - \frac{4C_{\eta}}{9} + \frac{16C_{\tau\Pi}}{9} - \frac{2z}{3} = 0$$

- Non-linear ODE describing the pressure anisotropy
- $C_{\tau\Pi}, C_{\eta}$ are phenomenological parameters

THE SUCCESS OF HYDRODYNAMICS

Hydrodynamic description accurate at earlier times than expected!

- Early time behaviour dictated by initial conditions
- Hydrodynamization: convergence to hydrodynamic description while the system is still very anisotropic and inhomogeneous
- Hydrodynamic description to equilibrium independent of initial conditions





HYDRODYNAMIC ATTRACTORS

How to describe this early convergence towards hydrodynamics?

Hydrodynamic attractors

- The hydrodynamic model contains *non-hydrodynamic degrees of freedom*, non-perturbative in nature
- These modes play a major role during the early times of the expanding plasma, very sensitive to initial conditions
- At hydrodynamisation scale still far from equilibrium, but the different initial solutions all become exponential close to to each other, and the
- Evolution of the system towards equilibrium effectively described by viscous hydrodynamics





LATE TIME ASYMPTOTICS

From asymptotics the phenomena of hydrodynamization is expected.

$$\mathcal{E}(\tau) = \frac{\Lambda}{\left(\Lambda\tau\right)^{1/3}} \left(1 + \sum_{k=1}^{+\infty} \frac{\epsilon_k}{\left(\Lambda\tau\right)^{2k/3}}\right), \ \tau \gg 1$$

Series is asymptotic: ϵ_k factorially divergent!

Late-time hydrodynamic attractor:

- described by a divergent, asymptotic perturbative series;
- resurgent properties encode all the information about the exponentially small non-hydrodynamic modes;
- initial conditions uniquely encoded in a set of parameters determining the strength of the non-hydrodynamic modes

RESURGENCE AND ASYMPTOTICS

$$\mathcal{E}(\tau) = \frac{\Lambda}{(\Lambda \tau)^{1/3}} \left(1 + \sum_{k=1}^{+\infty} \frac{\epsilon_k}{(\Lambda \tau)^{2k/3}} \right), \ \tau \gg 1 \qquad \text{Series is divergent, resurgent!}$$

How can we match the late-time behaviour to any given initial condition? Beyond a purely numerical analysis, can we describe the system at all times? Can we hope to describe the analytic behaviour of our observable?

Resurgence and asymptotics

- asymptotic expansions "converge" quite quickly;
- established asymptotic summation methods with exponential accuracy, effectively distinguishing between the exponentially close solutions at late-times;
- obtain **global analytic properties** of the asymptotic observables.

OUTLINE

0. Motivation

- I. Introduction to resurgent transseries
 - Resurgence and Borel transforms
 - Summations
- 2. Müller-Israel-Stewart hydrodynamics
 - From late to early times: dependence on initial conditions
 - Branch points and global behaviour
- 3. Summary

INTRODUCTION TO RESURGENT TRANSSERIES

1.

[IA,Basar,Schiappa' | 8]



Hamiltonian

$$H = -\frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{d}{dx}\right)^2 + V(x)$$

g > 0 How can we solve it?

Schrödinger Eq:

 $H\,\psi(x,g) = E(g)\,\psi(x,g)$

PERTURBATION THEORY IN QM



Why asymptotic? Existence of instantons Corrections to $E_{g.s.} \sim e^{-A/g} \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} E_n^{(1)} g^n$ Suppressed!



[Vanstein'64;Bender,Wu'73;Bogomolny,Zinn-Justin'80]

TRANSSERIES SOLUTION



requires all instantons to be well defined

 $E_{q.s.}(g,\sigma)$



ADDING ALL CONTRIBUTIONS

$$E_{g.s.}(g) \simeq \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} e^{-k A/g} E^{(k)}(g)$$

ADDINGALLCONTRIBUTIONS



ADDINGALLCONTRIBUTIONS

 $E_{g.s.}(g) \simeq (E^{(0)}(g) + e^{-A/g} E^{(1)}(g)) + e^{-2A/g} E^{(2)}(g) \cdots$ Optimal error after summing $E^{(0)}(g) + e^{-A/g} E^{(1)}(g)$?

ADDING ALL CONTRIBUTIONS

$$E_{g.s.}(g) \simeq E^{(0)}(g) + e^{-A/g}E^{(1)}(g) + e^{-2A/g}E^{(2)}(g) \cdots$$
Optimal error after summing
$$E^{(0)}(g) + e^{-A/g}E^{(1)}(g) ?$$

$$E^{(1)} \simeq \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} E_n^{(1)}g^n \text{ asymptotic series!}$$
Optimal error: $\left(E^{(1)} - E_N^{(1)}\right)(g) \cdot \left(e^{-A/g}\right)$
Error after summing perturbative and I-instanton is
$$E_{g.s.} - \left(E^{(0)} + e^{-A/g}E^{(1)}\right) \sim \left(e^{-2A/g}\right)$$

ADDINGALLCONTRIBUTIONS

$$E_{g.s.}(g) \simeq E^{(0)}(g) + e^{-A/g} E^{(1)}(g) + e^{-2A/g} E^{(2)}(g) \cdots$$

Error after summing perturbative and 1-instanton is

$$E_{g.s.} - \left(E^{(0)} + e^{-A/g} E^{(1)} \right) \sim e^{-2A/g}$$

Again
$$E^{(2)} \simeq \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} E_n^{(2)} g^n$$
 asymptotic series! $\left(E^{(2)} - E_N^{(2)}\right)(g) \sim e^{-A/g}$
Two-instanton sector addresses the new error
 $E_{g.s.} - \left(E^{(0)} + e^{-A/g} E^{(1)} + e^{-2A/g} E^{(2)}\right) \sim e^{-3A/g}$

ADDINGALLCONTRIBUTIONS



All instanton contributions conspire to cancel the errors at higher and higher orders!

ADDINGALLCONTRIBUTIONS



A TRUE ANALYTIC SOLUTION?



- Re-sum all asymptotic sectors $\mathcal{S}E^{(k)}(g)$
- Detemine σ from external data (boundary/initial conditions)
- This can be done for any value of g and encodes:

Analytic data (poles, zeros, branch cuts) Phase transitions (Stokes phenomena)

Next: Borel transform and re-summation

BOREL TRANSFORMS

Determine NP phenomena from an asymptotic series



$$B_E(s) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{E_n^{(0)}}{n!} s^n$$



BOREL TRANSFORMS

- •Non-perturbative phenomena: singularities in Borel plane
- Singularities usually will be branch cuts
- Singular directions: Stokes lines
- Structure of singularities can be very complex





TRANSSERIES SUMMATIONS

How to associate a function to the original asymptotic series?

- Optimal truncation and Hyperasymptotics
- Borel summation
- Transasymptotics

OPTIMAL TRUNCATION



LEVEL-1 HYPERASYMPTOTICS

Approximate the transseries including first exponential sector

$$E_{g.s.} \simeq E^{(0)}(g) + \sigma e^{-A/g} E^{(1)}(g) + \cdots$$

$$E_{\text{g.s.,Hyp}}(g) \simeq E_{\text{Hyp,0}}(g) + \sigma E_{\text{Hyp,1}}(g)$$
 Error ~ $e^{-2A/g}$

$$E_{\text{Hyp},0}(g) = \sum_{m=0}^{N_{\text{Hyp}}(g)-1} E_m^{(0)} g^m + g^{N_{\text{Hyp}}(g)-1} \frac{S_1}{2\pi i} \sum_{m=0}^{N_{\text{Hyp}}(g)/2-1} E_m^{(1)} F^{(1)} \left(g; \frac{N_{\text{Hyp}}(g) - m}{-A}\right)$$

$$E_{\text{Hyp},1}(g) = e^{-A/g} \sum_{m=0}^{N_{\text{Hyp}}(g)/2-1} E_m^{(1)} g^m$$

$$Hyperterminant: F^{(1)} \left(g; \frac{M}{a}\right)$$

$$e^{\frac{a}{g} + i\pi M} g^{1-M} \Gamma(M) \Gamma \left(1 - M, \frac{a}{g}\right)$$

[Berry, Howls'90,'91; Olde Daalhuis'95]

BORELRESUMMATION

Borel resummation: Laplace transform

$$\mathcal{S}E_{g.s.}(g) = \int_0^\infty \mathrm{d}s B_E(s) \mathrm{e}^{-s/g}$$

$$B_E(s) = \frac{A}{A-s}$$

- Straightforward in the directions without singularities
- Re-summation along Stokes directions: Non-perturbative ambiguity



ASIDE: NUMERICAL SUMMATION

What if we don't know the functional form of $B_E(s)$?

If we know finite number (N) of terms of Borel transform

- Approximation methods such as Padé approximants $\mathrm{BP}_E^{(N)}(s)$
- Numerical re-summation for each value of g

$$\mathcal{S}_N E_{g.s.}(g) = \int_0^\infty \mathrm{d}s \,\mathrm{BP}_E^{(N)}(s) \mathrm{e}^{-s/g}$$

BORELRESUMMATION

Approximate the transseries including first exponential sector

$$E_{g.s.} \simeq E^{(0)}(g) + \sigma e^{-A/g} E^{(1)}(g) + \cdots$$

$$E_{\rm g.s.,B}(g) \simeq S_{N_0} E^0(g) + \sigma e^{-A/g} S_{N_0} E^{(1)}(g)$$
 Error ~ $e^{-2A/g}$

$$\mathcal{S}_{N_0} E^{(j)} = \int_0^{+\infty} \mathrm{d}\xi \,\mathrm{e}^{-\xi/g} \,\mathrm{BP}_{N_0}[E^{(j)}](\xi)$$

Truncation: N_0 any, but at least 2A/g to minimise error

TRANSASYMPTOTIC SUMMATION

Transseries
$$E_{g.s.} \simeq \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \sigma^k e^{-kA/g} E^{(k)}(g)$$
 $E^{(k)} \sim \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} E_n^{(k)} g^n$

Change the order of summation: sum all exponentials for each order g^n

$$E_{\text{g.s.}} \simeq \sum_{k=0}^{+\infty} \sigma^k \, \mathrm{e}^{-kA/g} \sum_{n=0}^{+\infty} E_n^{(k)} \, g^n = \sum_{n=0}^{+\infty} g^n \, \sum_{k=0}^{+\infty} \left(\sigma \, \mathrm{e}^{-A/g} \right)^k \, E_n^{(k)} = \sum_{n=0}^{+\infty} g^n \, F_n(\tau)$$

where
$$F_n(\tau) = \sum_{k=0}^{+\infty} \tau^k E_n^{(k)}$$

- Validity: small g, exponentials can be order 1
- Study analytic properties of solution: e.g. branch points

[Costin'99,'01]

3. MÜLLER-ISRAEL-STEWART HYDRODYNAMICS

MIS CAUSAL HYDRODYNAMICS

Look back at the Müller-Israel-Stewart (MIS) ODE:

$$z C_{\tau\Pi} f f' + 4C_{\tau\Pi} f^2 + \left(z - \frac{16C_{\tau\Pi}}{3}\right) f - \frac{4C_{\eta}}{9} + \frac{16C_{\tau\Pi}}{9} - \frac{2z}{3} = 0$$

Write solution at late times as a resurgent transseries:

- single, purely decaying non-hydrodynamic mode
- describes decay to hydrodynamic attractor

$$\mathcal{F}(z,\sigma) = \sum_{n=0}^{+\infty} \sigma^n e^{-nAz} \Phi_n(z)$$

$$\Phi_n(z) = z^{-n\beta} \sum_{k=0}^{+\infty} a_k^{(n)} z^{-k}$$

 $\beta = -\frac{C_{\eta}}{C_{\tau\Pi}} \qquad A = \frac{3}{2C_{\tau\Pi}}$



[Heller,Spalinski' | 5; Basar,Dunne' | 5; IA,Spalinski' | 5]

SOLUTION AT EARLY TIMES

Finite solution: Stable solution, converging to a finite value at early times

$$f_{\text{finite}}(z) = \frac{2}{3} \left(1 - \beta + \mathcal{O}(z) \right), \quad z \to 0$$



Generic solution: I-parameter family of solutions divergent at early times

$$f_C(z) = \frac{2}{3} \left(\frac{C}{z^4} + 2 + \mathcal{O}(z) \right), \quad z \to 0$$

Can we relate transseries parameter σ and parameter C?

FROM LATE TO EARLY TIMES

Approximation attime z_0 : hyperasymptotics

$$f_{\text{approx}}(z_0) \simeq f_{\text{Hyp},0}(z_0) + \sigma f_{\text{Hyp},1}(z_0)$$

Approximation at time z_0 : Borel summation

$$f_{\text{approx}}(z_0) \simeq \mathcal{S}_{N_0} \Phi^0(z_0) + \sigma e^{-A z_0} \mathcal{S}_{N_0} \Phi^{(1)}(z_0)$$

 $f_{an}(z_0)$

Approximation at time z_0 : Taylor series method

Use analytic continuation via numerical Taylor series method, to bring early times solution to the finite value z_0 :

Solve
$$f_{approx}(z_0) = f_{an}(z_0)$$
 to obtain $\sigma(C)$

FROM LATE TO EARLY TIMES



- Strength of non-hydrodynamic mode σ highly sensitive to initial condition
- Choice of interpolation point z_0 changes accuracy:
 - I. Larger z_0 increases accuracy
 - 2. Include extra exponential sectors to increase accuracy at smaller z_0

TRANSASYMPTOTICS

Rearrange order of transmonomials in the transseries:

$$\mathscr{F}(z,\sigma) = \sum_{k=0}^{+\infty} z^{-k} \sum_{n=0}^{+\infty} \left(\sigma z^{-\beta} e^{-Az}\right)^n a_k^{(n)} = \sum_{k=0}^{+\infty} z^{-k} \sum_{n=0}^{+\infty} \tau^n a_k^{(n)}$$

Sum the transseries in a new regime $z^{-1} \ll \tau \ll 1$:

$$\mathcal{F}(z,\tau) = \sum_{k=0}^{+\infty} z^{-k} F_k(\tau) \qquad F_k(\tau) = \sum_{n=0}^{+\infty} \tau^n a_k^n$$

The sum over powers of τ can be done exactly!

Study analytic behaviour: poles, branch points...

[Costin et al'01-13; IA, Schiappa, Vonk 'to appear]

TRANSASYMPTOTICS



- This summation can also be used for determining $\sigma(C)$
- $\mathcal{F}(z,\tau) = 0$ are square root branch points, related to the single square root branch point of $W(\tau)$ at $\tau = -e^{-1}$.

BRANCH POINTS

Asymptotic prediction:

$$w_{\rm bp}(t) \simeq \frac{t}{A} - \frac{\beta}{A} \log(t) + \frac{1}{At} \left(\beta^2 \log(t) + \beta^2 + 5\beta - \frac{3}{A} \right), \quad \text{as} \quad t \to \infty$$

where
$$t \equiv \log\left(\frac{3\sigma e}{2A^{-\beta}}\right) + \pi i(1+2n), \quad n \in \mathbb{Z}$$

- numerical branch cut
- numerical branch point
- predicted branch point



NUMERICS VS ASYMPTOTICS

For the finite solution at early times $f_+(z)$



4.

SUMMARY/ FUTURE DIRECTIONS

SUMMARY

Hydrodynamic gradient expansion

- convergence towards attractor at late times
- description of the system after the decay of nonhydro modes,
- asymptotic properties encode the nonperturbative scales

Hydrodynamic Transseries

- encodes multiple scales of early and late times
- exponentially accurate summations interpolate between initial conditions and hydrodynamic regime
- global analytic behaviour: branch points





FUTURE DIRECTIONS

Applications to SYM plasma/other microscopic theories

- existence of a hydrodynamic attractor
- early time descriptions attainable
- multiple non-hydro modes

Analytic properties beyond hydrodynamics

- zeros of partition functions and phase transitions
- prediction of bifurcation phenomena in discrete systems
- connect distinct regimes of asymptotics





THANK YOU!

 $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} E_n g^n e^{-A/g}$